

Transcript of Hearing

8/20/2020

Enviva Pellets Greenwood, LLC (Enviva) - Draft Air Synthetic Minor Construction PUBLIC NOTICE #20-046-TV-C-H

COPY

Southern Reporting, Inc. Phone: 803.749.8100

Fax: 803.749.9991

Email: Depos@southernreporting.net

```
1
           SOUTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND
 2
                    ENVIRONMENTAL CONTROL
 3
                 BUREAU OF AIR QUALITY (BAQ)
 4
 5
    State of South Carolina
    County of Greenwood
                                           Transcript of
 6
                                           Public Hearing
7
    In Re: Notice of a
                                          Public Notice #
    Draft Air Synthetic Minor
                                           20-046-TV-C-H
8
    Construction Permit
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
    Date: August 20, 2020
17
    Time: 6:31 p.m.
    Location: Via Remote Videoconference and/or
18
    Teleconference
19
20
                          Reported by
21
                    Alison N. Peterson
22
23
24
25
```

1	APPEARANCES
2	DHEC officials present:
3	Monica Taylor Lawra Boyce
4	Sean Briggs
5	Kristy Ellenberg Katherine Yon
6	Speakers from the public:
7	Tandy Taylor Trip Chavis Charles McKinney Croft Hollingsworth
8	Tammy Gettys Chief Parr Wendi Andrews Loretta Slater
9	Ken Coffey Alectron Dorfman Donald Rhodes Erniko Brown
10	James C. Sanders, Jr. Elizabeth Kress
11	Gary Harbour, Ph.D. Jimmy Corley
12	Lucia Ibarra Jaime Wisegarver
13	Sabrina Miller Brad Thompson Tim Adams Xavier Boatright
14	Ken Leach Pamela Greenlaw Rev. Leo Woodberry Kim Cesafsky Rev. Dallas Conyers Michael Meetze
15	Rev. Dallas Conyers Michael Meetze Chris Brown Varis Woodberry Heather Hillaker Jim Potts
16	Luke Penney Kayla Livingston
17	Annemarie Humm Dr. Florence Anoruo
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

- 1 **PROCEEDINGS** 2 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: I want to 3 welcome you all here. Thank you for joining us for DHEC's virtual public hearing for the draft 4 5 air construction permit for Enviva Pellets 6 Greenwood, LLC. I am Lawra Boyce. I am the 7 community engagement coordinator for DHEC's office 8 of environmental affairs. I will serve as the 9 technology host tonight, and there are also 10 several other people on our tech team assisting 11 I will ask them to introduce themselves. 12 MR. BRIGGS: Hello, everyone. This is 13 Sean Briggs. 14 MS. ELLENBERG: Hello, everybody. 15 is Kristy Ellenberg. 16 MS. YON: Good evening. This is Katherine Yon. 17 18 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Great. Thanks,
- 19 guys.

We are using this technology to provide

- 21 opportunities for continued participation in all
- of our decision-making processes while we do our
- 23 part to reduce the spread of Coronavirus by
- 24 following current federal and state guidelines
- 25 that promote social distancing. We want to hear

20

- 1 from all of you, especially those who are
- 2 interested. But as the state's public health
- 3 agency, we must make public health and safety a
- 4 priority. We do encourage you to help stop the
- 5 spread of COVID by washing your hands, staying at
- 6 home when you're sick, covering any coughs and
- 7 keeping surfaces clean. And, most importantly, we
- 8 encourage you to stay up to date and stay informed
- 9 of COVID-19 by visiting our web page,
- 10 scdhec.gov/covid19.
- 11 Your participation is very important to
- 12 us tonight so we have gone to extensive efforts to
- 13 ensure that anyone who's interested in engaging
- 14 with us has the ability to do so. We are
- 15 continuing to evaluate these tools and
- 16 accommodations, and we welcome your input on how
- 17 we may be able to improve your experience with
- 18 virtual participation. So please give us your
- 19 thoughts in a feedback survey that will be posted
- on our web page after tonight's hearing.
- In order to maximize your experience
- 22 tonight, we do encourage you to close other
- 23 applications that may be running on your computer
- 24 and turn off any other streaming services or
- 25 devices at your location for the duration of the

- 1 virtual hearing. As I've mentioned before, all of
- 2 your lines have been muted in order to minimize
- 3 background noise and echoing so that everyone can
- 4 hear the presenters. We ask that you please keep
- 5 your lines muted until after the presentation,
- 6 when we will provide instructions on how to unmute
- 7 if you'd like to make a comment.
- 8 The virtual hearing will be recorded,
- 9 and the recording will be placed on our web page
- 10 in the next few days. We have started the
- 11 recording.
- 12 Monica Taylor will be serving as your
- 13 hearing officer tonight, and I will assist after
- 14 the presentation with additional instructions for
- 15 the comment portion of the hearing.
- Okay, Monica. If you are ready, I
- 17 think we can go ahead and get started.
- 18 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you,
- 19 Lawra. The time is now 6:34 p.m., on Thursday,
- 20 August 20th, 2020. And this public hearing
- 21 regarding Enviva Pellet Greenwood, LLC, Draft
- 22 Synthetic Runner Air Construction Permit,
- Number 1240-0133-CC, will now begin.
- My name is Monica Taylor. I'm the
- 25 public participation coordinator for DHEC's Bureau

- of Air Quality. I will be serving as the hearing
- 2 officer for tonight's virtual hearing. Thank you
- 3 all for taking the time to join us this evening.
- 4 This hearing is being held by South Carolina
- 5 Department of Health and Environmental Control,
- 6 also known as DHEC, to accept oral comments on
- 7 Enviva Pellet Greenwood, LLC, draft synthetic
- 8 minor air construction permit. DHEC is currently
- 9 in technical review of the synthetic minor air
- 10 construction permit, in which Enviva is required
- 11 to obtain in order to complete the proposed
- 12 project. Tonight's hearing is part of DHEC's
- 13 technical review.
- We are now on our agenda for this
- 15 evening.
- So far we have completed instructions
- 17 for remote participation. Now, I will ask the
- 18 court reporter for the public hearing to introduce
- 19 herself at this time.
- 20 THE COURT REPORTER: Hello. My name is
- 21 Ali Peterson, and I will be the court reporter
- 22 this evening.
- 23 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you,
- 24 Ali.
- Ms. Peterson is recording everything

- 1 that is said during this public hearing. She will
- 2 later prepare a written transcript that will be
- 3 included in DHEC's official record for Enviva
- 4 proposed project.
- 5 DHEC has established a web page for
- 6 access to information and documents related to the
- 7 proposed project. The web page can be found at
- 8 www.scdhec.gov/enviva. The presentation you will
- 9 see tonight is posted on the web page. A
- 10 recording of the transcript of this hearing will
- 11 also be available on the web page before the close
- 12 of the comment period.
- 13 If you have not already done so, we
- 14 encourage you to go to the web page by close of
- 15 business tomorrow and complete the online
- 16 registration form for this hearing. This will let
- 17 us know how to notify you of DHEC's decision on
- 18 the proposed project. Again, the registration
- 19 form will remain open through close of business
- 20 tomorrow.
- 21 Your comments are a very important part
- of DHEC's permitting process. The information you
- 23 share will be reviewed and could provide DHEC
- 24 staff with additional information to consider when
- 25 making the final decision. A final decision on

- 1 the proposed project has not yet been made and
- 2 will not be made here tonight. The purpose of
- 3 this hearing is for you to provide additional
- 4 comments before a final decision is made. DHEC
- 5 welcomes and encourage your comments through the
- 6 end of the public comment period.
- 7 Before our presentation begins, here
- 8 are just a few ground rules for tonight's hearing.
- 9 In order for this hearing to proceed in an
- 10 efficient and timely manner, the following
- 11 quidelines have been established:
- 12 Tonight we will not be answering
- 13 questions. The purpose of the public hearing is
- 14 to present an overview of the proposed project and
- 15 allow for oral comments to be officially received
- 16 for the record.
- 17 So that everyone has an opportunity to
- 18 speak, your comments should not go over three
- 19 minutes. At the end of the three minutes, a chime
- 20 will sound and we ask that you finish your
- 21 thoughts so that we may be able to have time for
- 22 all who have requested to speak tonight. If you
- are not able to complete your comments within the
- 24 allotted time, you may also submit them in writing
- 25 before the end of the public comment period. We

- 1 will provide the link for submitting written
- 2 comments at the end of the presentation.
- Please keep in mind any comments made
- 4 via the chat box during tonight's public hearing
- 5 will not serve as an official comment on record,
- 6 and the agency will not respond to any written
- 7 comments posted in the chat box. However,
- 8 anything typed in the chat box is subject to be
- 9 included in the record of the public hearing.
- 10 Please be respectful of those
- 11 presenting information or making comments and
- 12 allow the time limit that has been set. Each
- 13 person has the right to participate tonight, and
- 14 no one comment is more important than another.
- 15 Everyone who wishes to make a comment will be
- 16 given an equal opportunity to do so.
- 17 And, finally, please do not interrupt
- 18 or ask other participants or DHEC staff to respond
- 19 to comments during tonight's hearing. Should any
- 20 comments or actions begin to distract from the
- intent of this hearing, the speaker may be placed
- on mute or removed from the online platform.
- The order of tonight's public hearing
- 24 will go as follows:
- 25 An overview of Enviva's Pellet

- 1 Greenwood, LLC, proposed project will be provided
- 2 tonight by DHEC's Bureau of Air Quality permit
- 3 writer, Jo Anna Cunningham.
- 4 Following Jo Anna's presentation, we
- 5 will begin calling on those who have indicated
- 6 during preregistration that you would like to make
- 7 a comment. If you have decided that you no longer
- 8 wish to speak, when you are called on, you may
- 9 decline at that time.
- 10 When we have finished hearing from
- 11 everyone who has preregistered to speak, those who
- 12 did not preregister will have the opportunity to
- 13 provide an oral comment as well. At that time,
- 14 our tech host will give instructions on how to
- 15 comment from your remote location.
- 16 Please remember, the focus of this
- 17 public hearing is on Enviva's proposed project,
- 18 and a final decision will not be made here
- 19 tonight, nor will it be based upon how many people
- 20 express the same concerns.
- 21 We will now turn it over to Jo Anna
- 22 Cunningham for an overview of the proposed
- 23 project. Jo Anna?
- MS. CUNNINGHAM: Thank you, Monica.
- 25 Good evening. My name is Jo Anna

- 1 Cunningham. I've been a permit writer with SC
- 2 DHEC Bureau of Air Quality Permitting Division
- 3 since 2001. I am the air permit writer assigned
- 4 to the Enviva Greenwood, LLC, project, herein
- 5 referred to as Enviva Greenwood.
- I am now on the slide titled
- 7 "Permitting Process." The permitting process
- 8 starts when an application is received and
- 9 reviewed for technical completeness to ensure the
- 10 project will be in compliance with all applicable
- 11 regulations. Once the application has been
- 12 reviewed for technical completeness, the
- department determines which type of permit is
- 14 required. For example, minor permit, major permit
- or synthetic minor permit. The permit is drafted
- 16 with all of the applicable regulations.
- 17 There is an opportunity for public
- input to ensure that all interested persons have
- 19 an opportunity to provide input on the project.
- 20 We are currently at this stage in the process.
- 21 Once all of these steps are complete, final permit
- 22 decision is made.
- I am now on the slide titled "Site
- 24 Overview." The facility was originally built and
- operated by Colombo Energy starting on

- 1 September 22nd, 2016. Enviva Greenwood purchased
- and began operating the facility on March 7th,
- 3 2018. Enviva Greenwood is a wood pellet
- 4 manufacturing facility. The facility produces
- 5 wood pellets that are used for fuel in industrial
- 6 boilers.
- 7 I am now on Slide 9, the Site Location
- 8 Map. This is a map showing the location of the
- 9 site. The Enviva Greenwood operations are
- 10 outlined in yellow. The facility is located at
- 11 200 Enviva Way, Greenwood, South Carolina 29646.
- I am now on the slide titled "Proposed
- 13 Project Overview." Enviva Greenwood submitted an
- 14 air construction permit application on
- 15 February 10th, 2020, for which the purpose is
- 16 two-fold: one, to reduce particulate matter, dust
- 17 emissions; and, two, increase production. The
- 18 particulate matter emissions will be reduced
- 19 through the addition of more efficient process
- 20 equipment, pollution control device upgrades, and
- 21 the addition of new particulate control equipment.
- The potential to emit of particulate
- 23 matter emissions before the proposed construction
- 24 permit have been calculated as 174 tons per year.
- 25 The emissions are based on the current permitted

- 1 production limit and the operation of the
- 2 particulate matter control devices.
- 3 The potential to emit of particulate
- 4 matter emissions after the proposed construction
- 5 project have been calculated as 168 tons per year.
- 6 The emissions are based on operation of the
- 7 new/updated particulate matter control devices,
- 8 implementation of the particulate matter reduction
- 9 strategies, and accounts for the proposed increase
- in production to 660,000 oven-dried tons per year,
- 11 a 25 percent increase.
- I am now on the slide titled "Dry
- 13 Hammermills." The picture on the left shows an
- 14 example of a -- of horizontal dry hammermills,
- 15 which are existing equipment at the facility. The
- 16 picture on the right shows an example of a hammer
- 17 that is inside a vertical dry hammermill, which is
- 18 proposed equipment for this construction project.
- I am now on Slide 12. Proposed
- 20 particulate dust reduction strategies include
- 21 replacing the older, less efficient, horizontal
- 22 dry hammermills with new, efficient, vertical dry
- 23 hammermills. Unlike the horizontal dry
- 24 hammermills, the new vertical dry hammermills are
- 25 designed with screens to ensure proper sizing of

- 1 the incoming wood chips, use gravity to drop the
- 2 wood chips into a receiving throat and transfer to
- 3 a conveyer. In addition, the hammers, which are
- 4 encased within a metal housing, have the
- 5 capability to rotate in a direction which enables
- 6 them to efficiently reduce the size of the wood
- 7 chips. Their design features will result in less
- 8 particulate matter generated as the wood chips are
- 9 processed.
- 10 The existing wet electrostatic
- 11 precipitator (WESP) will replace specific
- 12 cyclofilters to remove particulate matter (PM)
- 13 from the new vertical dry hammermills. The WESP
- 14 uses electrostatic forces to remove particulate
- 15 matter from the process prior to venting clean air
- 16 to the atmosphere. It currently controls
- 17 particulate matter from the existing equipment:
- 18 green hammermills 1 through 4, green chip silo,
- 19 furnace, and the rotary dryer. The pollution
- 20 control efficiency of a WESP is better than that
- of a cyclofilter, which is currently used at the
- 22 facility.
- 23 The proposed project includes the
- 24 addition of a second particulate matter control
- 25 device for the vertical dry hammermills, a bin

- 1 vent filter, which will be in series with the
- 2 WESP, and this will allow the process airstream to
- 3 flow through two separate devices before venting
- 4 to the ambient air.
- 5 For the proposed project, volatile
- 6 organic compounds (VOCs) emissions from the
- 7 vertical dry hammermills will be controlled by the
- 8 existing regenerative thermal oxidizer (RTO),
- 9 which will result in a decrease in facility-wide
- 10 actual VOCs emissions. I will speak more about
- 11 the pollution control equipment later in the
- 12 presentation.
- I am now on Slide 13. The project
- 14 includes the addition of three pelletizers, which
- is where the wood pellets are formed; one pellet
- 16 cooler, which is where the wood pellets are
- 17 cooled; and a new PM control device, a baghouse.
- 18 The picture on the lower left in the bottom left
- 19 corner of the picture is an example of
- 20 pelletizers. The picture on the lower is an
- 21 example of baghouses.
- I am now on the slide titled "Green
- 23 Hammermill." There will be the addition of one
- 24 green hammermill. Green hammermills are equipment
- located near the beginning of the wood pellet

- 1 manufacturing process. The green hammermills
- 2 reduce the wood chip size before the wood chips
- 3 proceed to the drying operations.
- 4 PM emissions from the new green
- 5 hammermill will be controlled by the existing
- 6 particulate matter control device, WESP. And VOC
- 7 emissions will be controlled by the existing VOC
- 8 destruction equipment, regenerative thermal
- 9 oxidizer (RTO).
- I am now on the slide titled "Summary
- of Proposed Changes." A summary of proposed
- 12 changes are as follows:
- 13 Replace five existing dry hammermills
- 14 with 36 new dry hammermills which have improved
- 15 efficiency for reducing the wood chip size. The
- 16 emissions from the dry hammermills will be routed
- 17 to the existing wet electrostatic precipitator
- 18 (WESP) to control particulate matter emissions and
- 19 to the existing regenerative thermal oxidizer,
- 20 also known as an RTO or incinerator, to control
- volatile organic compounds (VOCs) emissions.
- 22 Addition of a second PM control device
- 23 for the dry hammermills, bin vent filter.
- 24 Addition of three pelletizers, one
- pellet cooler, and a new baghouse.

- 1 Addition of one green hammermill.
- 2 PM emissions will be controlled by the
- 3 existing WESP, and VOC emissions will be
- 4 controlled by the existing VOC destruction device,
- 5 RTO.
- I am now on Slide 16. All process
- 7 emissions at Enviva Greenwood are routed to
- 8 control devices. This is a summary of Enviva
- 9 Greenwood's pollution control equipment:
- 10 Wet electrostatic precipitator (WESP).
- 11 As mentioned earlier, a WESP is a control device
- 12 which uses electrostatic forces to remove
- 13 particulate matter from the process prior to
- 14 venting clean air to the atmosphere.
- 15 Baghouses; baghouses with integrated
- 16 cyclones; cyclone; and bin vent filters, which are
- 17 pollution control devices that use fabric filter
- 18 media to capture and remove particulate matter
- 19 from the process prior to venting clean air to the
- 20 atmosphere.
- Volatile organic compounds (VOCs)
- 22 destruction equipment consisting of a regenerative
- 23 thermal oxidizer (RTO) and regenerative catalytic
- 24 oxidizers (RCOs). The RTO and RCOs are pollution
- 25 control devices which incinerate volatile organic

- 1 compounds. VOCs are compounds that easily become
- 2 vapors or gases. The proposed project will modify
- 3 the existing RTO and RCOs to reflect Enviva
- 4 Greenwood's final engineering design. As such,
- 5 they will have a greater heat input capacity for
- 6 VOC destruction.
- 7 I am now on the slide titled "Air
- 8 Quality Analysis." As mentioned earlier, as part
- 9 of the air permitting process, the facility is
- 10 also required to demonstrate compliance with
- 11 National Ambient Air Quality Standards for
- 12 particulate less than 10 microns and less than 2.5
- 13 microns. These standards are established to be
- 14 protective of public health and welfare.
- 15 Enviva Greenwood's compliance
- 16 demonstration with the standards for PM10 and
- 17 PM2.5 was completed using an EPA-approved model,
- 18 AERMOD, assuming the facility was operating all of
- 19 its equipment at full capacity 24 hours per day,
- 20 every day of the year. Based on the compliance
- 21 demonstration conducted, the facility meets these
- 22 standards, as well as standards for all other
- 23 emitted, regulated pollutants, including both
- 24 criteria and air toxic pollutants.
- 25 I am now on the slide titled "Draft Air

- 1 Construction Permit Regulatory Requirements."
- 2 State and federal regulations have established
- 3 standards that are protective of the environment
- 4 and public health, including the health of
- 5 sensitive populations such as asthmatics,
- 6 children, and the elderly. The permit contains
- 7 the applicable limits and regulations from all
- 8 applicable federal and state air regulations. The
- 9 applicable state and federal regulations for the
- 10 Enviva Greenwood operations are as listed.
- Note that the fugitive dust regulation
- 12 includes dust emissions from storage piles and
- 13 on-site traffic.
- I am now on the slide titled "Draft Air
- 15 Construction Permit Limits." Enviva Greenwood
- 16 currently operates as a synthetic minor source of
- 17 emissions. Federally enforceable limits have been
- 18 established to limit criteria pollutants PM, PM10,
- 19 PM2.5, and VOCs emissions to less than 250 tons
- 20 per year each pollutant and less than 10 tons per
- 21 year for any single HAP and less than 25 tons per
- 22 year for total combined HAPs. These previously
- 23 established limits will remain in place.
- In addition, with this proposed project
- 25 a production limit of 660,000 oven-dried tons per

- 1 year will be established to ensure that the
- 2 facility retains its status as a synthetic minor
- 3 source of emissions.
- I am now on the slide titled "Draft Air
- 5 Construction Permit Requirements." The draft
- 6 construction permit contains a requirement that
- 7 the facility shall maintain the current permitted
- 8 production rate until all control device upgrades
- 9 and additions have been completed. The draft air
- 10 construction permit also contains adequate
- 11 monitoring to ensure compliance with all
- 12 applicable permit limits and requirements. The
- draft air construction permit also contains
- 14 requirements for source tests to be conducted
- 15 annually and every five years.
- 16 Additionally, the draft air
- 17 construction permit requires the facility to
- 18 calculate and submit semiannual reports of
- 19 emissions and production amounts. The draft
- 20 construction permit also contains a requirement to
- 21 follow the site's existing dust control plan,
- 22 which I will explain further on the next slide.
- I am now on the slide titled "Dust
- 24 Control Plan." Details regarding the dust control
- 25 plan includes steps to minimize fugitive

- 1 particulate matter, dust, generated on site from
- 2 going beyond facility property boundaries.
- Written procedures, training plans, and
- 4 a maintenance schedule for all particulate matter
- 5 control equipment and process systems.
- 6 Use of a water truck on on-site roads.
- 7 And the dust control plan is required
- 8 to be reviewed, reassessed, and updated when
- 9 needed.
- I am now on Slide 22. At the request
- of community members, there are two particulate
- 12 matter air sensors testing concentrations in the
- 13 community in order to determine the particulate
- 14 matter trends. One of the sensors also monitors
- 15 for metrological data such as wind speed and
- 16 relative humidity.
- 17 Air sensors are small, relatively
- 18 inexpensive air samplers. Unlike SC DHEC's large
- 19 ambient air monitors, which meet strict federal
- 20 guidelines, the air sensors only give a general
- 21 overall look at whether certain pollutants are
- 22 present. SC DHEC looks at the trends to see if
- 23 there may be potential problems. The air sensors
- 24 can only determine if a pollutant is or is not
- 25 present. Since a physical sample is not obtained,

- 1 SC DHEC can't determine the origin of the PM.
- I am now on the slide titled "Ambient
- 3 Sensor Data." In both pictures, the orange line
- 4 represents the air quality PM standard. The blue
- 5 wavy line beneath the orange line represents the
- 6 actual sensor readings for the time period
- 7 indicated. As noted, trends from both sensors are
- 8 below the air quality PM standard.
- 9 I am now on the slide titled
- 10 "Compliance Status." In December 2018 through
- 11 March 2019, a series of stack tests were
- 12 performed. The results indicated that Enviva
- 13 Greenwood operations were in compliance with the
- 14 emission limits.
- In 2019, SC DHEC conducted several
- 16 inspections of the facility's operations. The
- 17 facility was cited for several permit and
- 18 regulatory violations.
- In January 2020, the facility was
- 20 issued a Notice of Alleged Violation and Notice of
- 21 Enforcement Conference.
- In July 2020, a consent order, which
- included a civil penalty of \$13,000, was executed.
- 24 The order also required an updated dust control
- 25 plan be submitted to the department by

- 1 August 16th, 2020. The updated dust control plan
- 2 was submitted on time. The full consent order and
- 3 penalty details can be viewed by going to the
- 4 Enviva web page on the DHEC website.
- I am now on the slide titled "Next
- 6 Steps." The next steps are DHEC will review all
- 7 comments received, provide written responses to
- 8 all comments, and make a final decision. The
- 9 final decision date begins the 15-day appeal
- 10 period.
- I am now on the slide titled "DHEC
- 12 Contacts." If you have any questions about the
- 13 proposed project, please let me know. My contact
- 14 information is on the screen. If you prefer to
- 15 speak to someone locally, you can contact Samuel
- 16 Madden in our Greenwood office. His contact
- 17 information is also on the screen.
- 18 I am now on the slide titled "How to
- 19 Comment." Comments can be submitted by mail or
- 20 e-mail through August 27th, 2020, to BAQ's public
- 21 notice coordinator, DHEC/BAQ. That's D-H-E-C
- 22 forward slash B-A-Q; 2600 Bull Street, Columbia,
- 23 South Carolina 29201. And e-mail at
- 24 airpncomments@dhec.sc.gov. That's A-I-R P-N
- 25 C-O-M-M-E-N-T-S at D-H-E-C dot S-C dot G-O-V. The

- 1 application and draft permit can be found at
- 2 www.scdhec.gov/enviva. That's W-W-W dot S-C
- 3 D-H-E-C dot G-O-V forward slash E-N-V-I-V-A.
- 4 Thank you for your time and
- 5 participation in this evening's public hearing.
- 6 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Jo Anna, thank
- you for providing us with that great overview.
- I would also like to mention if you
- 9 have any issues viewing the presentation, a copy
- 10 of the full presentation is also available on our
- 11 website at www.scdhec.gov/enviva.
- 12 I will now call on those of you who
- 13 have indicated during our preregistration that you
- 14 would like to make a comment. When it is your
- 15 turn, clearly state and spell your name and
- 16 identify any organizations or group you are
- 17 providing your comment on behalf of. Remember to
- 18 unmute your line by clicking the microphone on
- 19 your screen or by using star six. If you are
- joining us by phone, please remember that you will
- 21 have three minutes' limit to present your
- 22 comments. At the end of the three minutes, a
- 23 chime will sound, and we will ask you to finish
- those final thoughts so we may be able to have
- 25 time for all who have requested to speak tonight.

- I will start by calling on Tandy
- 2 Taylor. Tandy, please unmute.
- MS. TAYLOR: Hello, this is Tandy
- 4 Taylor. Can you hear me?
- 5 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes, I can.
- 6 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 7 hear you well.
- 8 MS. TAYLOR: Okay. Great. Thank you.
- 9 I'm connecting by telephone today, and so it's a
- 10 little harder to know what I'm doing.
- 11 Thank you so much for allowing me the
- 12 opportunity to speak today. My name is Tandy
- 13 Taylor, and I am associate pastor at Triune Mercy
- 14 Center, a church for the homeless in Greenville.
- 15 I'm also vice chair of the local chapter of the
- 16 Climate Reality Project, which has more than 500
- 17 members in the -- in ten counties across the
- 18 Upstate. I speak on their behalf today.
- 19 While I applaud the installation of new
- 20 equipment that is in this permit, I urge you to
- 21 deny any expansion of the wood pellet industry in
- 22 South Carolina. Two of our primary assets as a
- 23 state are our people and our natural resources.
- 24 Enviva's proposed increase in operations will not
- only endanger the health of nearby residents but

- 1 also destroy much of our forestland. Neighbors of
- 2 the plan report that they cannot sit out in their
- 3 yards without being covered in sawdust. Even with
- 4 staying indoors, the tiny particulates of sawdust
- 5 end up in their lungs. These residents may
- 6 appreciate the good-paying jobs now, but they will
- 7 pay a high price later in health impacts and
- 8 medical bills.
- 9 And I also want to point out that
- 10 Enviva is not using primarily lumbar yard scraps
- or trees that have to be cut down anyway for
- 12 thinning the forests. They clearcut mature
- 13 forests. This has been documented by people
- 14 following the logging trucks out of the forest and
- 15 to the Enviva plant. We cannot allow them to
- 16 continue cutting down the magnificent forests of
- 17 our state.
- 18 The trees are worth much more to us as
- 19 a living forest than as single-use wood pellets.
- 20 Forests absorb carbon, so they are a major piece
- of the puzzle on addressing the high levels of
- 22 carbon in our atmosphere. We need to be planting
- 23 more forests, not cutting down the ones we have.
- 24 Forests also provide rain retention so that
- there's less risk of flooding when heavy rains

- 1 come, as they are doing more and more frequently
- 2 now in our area. We need for our forests to stay
- 3 intact.
- 4 Before you consider approving Enviva's
- 5 permit request, I urge you to complete a full
- 6 environmental justice report, including analysis
- 7 of all the potential harm to forests and climate
- 8 as well as the health and wellbeing of residents.
- 9 And I call on you to educate yourself on the wood
- 10 pellet industry by watching the documentary
- 11 entitled "BURNED: Are Trees the New Coal?" The
- 12 link to that documentary is
- 13 www.burnedthemovie.com.
- On many different fronts, Enviva's
- 15 request to expand their operations makes no sense
- 16 at all. Please deny their permit. Thank you so
- 17 much for allowing me to speak tonight.
- 18 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you,
- 19 Ms. Taylor. Thank you for your comment.
- We would also like to mention as a
- 21 reminder, if you are not called upon to speak at
- the moment, could you please leave all mics muted.
- When it's your turn to leave a comment, we will
- 24 ask you to unmute your mic at that time.
- We will now call on Charles McKinney.

- 1 Mr. McKinney, if you are muted, please unmute your
- 2 mic by -- if you are connecting through your
- 3 computer, you can do so by tapping the microphone.
- 4 If you are on the phone, you can do so by pressing
- 5 star six.
- 6 MR. MCKINNEY: I'm on the phone.
- 7 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Great. We can
- 8 hear you well.
- 9 MR. MCKINNEY: Hello?
- 10 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 11 Please proceed.
- MR. MCKINNEY: Can you hear me?
- 13 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, sir. We
- 14 can indeed hear you. If you will start by stating
- 15 your name and spelling it and leaving your
- 16 comments.
- 17 MR. MCKINNEY: Charles Wagner McKinney,
- 18 Senior; C-H-A-R-L-E-S W-A-G-N-E-R M-C-K-I-N-N-E-Y
- 19 S-R. I am president of Laurens County Forest
- 20 Landowners Association, a membership of some 90
- 21 forest landowners. Our association members are
- 22 active participants in South Carolina's largest
- 23 industry, the \$21 billion forestry industry. Our
- 24 industry is a primary contributor for the
- 25 steadiness of our standing forests, the clean air

- 1 quality, the clean water, and the thriving
- 2 communities of our state.
- 3 As a result of an evolving -- where
- 4 we're in a society wherein families have been
- 5 forced to adopt and adapt their farming practices
- 6 in order to retain their family property, our
- 7 state in the southeast have more standing acres of
- 8 timber than at any time in our recorded history.
- 9 This standing acreage of timber, referred to as
- 10 the "wall of wood" is the product of forestry
- 11 associations of the local, state, and regional
- 12 levels united in recruiting individuals to join in
- 13 the stewardship and management of our woodlands
- 14 through a committed and approved plan of action.
- 15 Although well regulated with this wall of wood,
- 16 the timber industry is in a period of low prices.
- 17 A source of demand is essential for the
- 18 competitive and orderly harvest that ensures the
- 19 health of our forests.
- We are here today to put input toward a
- 21 regulatory decision you will make concerning
- 22 Envira's request in for an air quality permit
- 23 allowing the upgrading of this dry hammermills
- 24 with modernized air quality instrumentation and
- 25 its being allowed to increase its production

- 1 capability. This is vital to the current physical
- 2 condition of the forestry industry.
- 3 Envira's not an industry isolated into
- 4 itself. It is immersed in the local community,
- 5 supporting many community activities. Since
- 6 assuming control of the Greenwood facility from
- 7 Colombo Energy in 2018, Envira has communicated
- 8 with the surrounding community and continuously
- 9 worked at improving the operation at this
- 10 facility.
- 11 Envira's request for a new air quality
- 12 permit, the upgrading of its dry hammermills with
- 13 modernized air quality instrumentation to assure a
- 14 cleaner environment and the request for an
- increase in production capability, should be
- 16 approved, and we thank you very much.
- 17 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 18 We will now call on Tammy Gettys.
- 19 Ms. Gettys, if you could unmute your microphone.
- MS. GETTYS: Yes.
- 21 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: You may start
- 22 by stating your name and spelling it as well as.
- 23 Thank you.
- MS. GETTYS: Hello. My name is Tammy
- 25 Gettys, T-A-M-M-Y G-E-T-T-Y-S. I am here today to

- 1 let DHEC know that there is definitely a problem
- with wood fine, wood fines, and groundwood from
- 3 the Enviva operations. I submitted a report of a
- 4 sample analysis that was taken of the wood that
- 5 came from my pool and from my deck, and those
- 6 samples came back as being groundwood and wood
- 7 fines from Enviva's operations. They said another
- 8 possible source, it could have been trafficked
- 9 from a nearby road. But my nearby road traffic, I
- 10 have brush that's high enough that would cover
- 11 that. The pollution, wood fine and the wood dust,
- 12 is coming over the woods through some trees here,
- 13 getting right into my property going up my entire
- 14 neighborhood.
- 15 And I'm here, you know, to represent
- 16 the neighborhood because the wood dust is
- 17 dangerous. I know it has damaged my -- some of my
- 18 property. I've had to replace things. I can say,
- 19 you know, they didn't want to replace everything.
- 20 They wanted to try to half fix something that's
- 21 half broke.
- But other than that, we have met with
- 23 Chris Brown several times from Enviva, and he has
- 24 tried his best to do what he could to help us and
- 25 ensure us that this permit is going to stop the

- 1 pollution. And I do want to believe him that it's
- 2 wanting to stop, that it's going to stop this
- 3 pollution. But this pollution that only -- I
- 4 mean, that you can definitely see, there's a part
- 5 that we can't see that it's definitely we know is
- 6 in our lungs, it's going into our lungs.
- 7 I have reports from OSHA. I have
- 8 reports from OSHA and a report from CCOHS, which
- 9 list health concerns -- OSH Answers fact sheets,
- 10 the health concerns of wood dust have been
- 11 associated to substances in the wood, bacteria,
- 12 molds, or fungi. But that wood is definitely
- 13 coming definitely straight in our neighborhood.
- 14 It's considered a carcinogenic to humans. And I'm
- 15 reading this from off their website. It --
- 16 associated with toxins. It can affect your skin,
- 17 your eyes, and also it can affect --
- 18 (Timer sounds.)
- 19 MS. GETTYS: Is that three minutes?
- 20 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Ms. Gettys, it
- 21 has been three minutes. If you would like to
- 22 finish your thought here and your sentence --
- MS. GETTYS: Yeah.
- 24 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: -- we will
- 25 provide time or we will still provide an

- 1 opportunity to continue to submit your comments
- via a written platform, and we will provide that
- 3 information after all have spoken. So please
- 4 continue to finish, and we'll move on.
- 5 MS. GETTYS: Okay. And our concerns
- 6 here are the wood, the pollution of what it's
- 7 doing to our bodies -- our lungs, our bodies.
- 8 And what I'm asking is I have a -- I
- 9 would just like for the -- what were you saying
- 10 earlier, 35 percent? I was told by DHEC that it
- 11 was only a 20 percent that they needed to meet.
- 12 And according to my records, they're not meeting
- 13 the 20 percent all the time. And I would really
- 14 just ask for my neighborhood's -- that be reduced,
- 15 that 35 percent should no way be that high at all.
- And one last thing. I understood that
- 17 the permit, it's a synthetic minor source, means
- 18 it's exempt from the Clean Air Act's proposed --
- 19 proposed 423. Well, I hope that is not the case.
- 20 I do want to get that standard down lowered so we
- 21 can have less pollution in our neighborhood.
- HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 23 Thank you so much, Ms. Gettys.
- MS. GETTYS: You're welcome.
- 25 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Again, I want

- 1 to remind all of the participants of our
- 2 three-minute time limit in order for us to allow
- 3 everyone the opportunity to leave a comment
- 4 tonight. We will also be providing our web
- 5 address in which you could submit your comment in
- 6 writing if you do not have time to provide all of
- 7 the information here tonight.
- 8 We would -- we'll move on. I will call
- 9 on Ms. Wendi Andrews. And following Ms. Wendi,
- 10 Lucia Ibarra will be following Ms. Andrews.
- Ms. Andrews, please unmute, and you may
- 12 begin by stating your name and spelling it for the
- 13 record as well.
- 14 MS. ANDREWS: Yes. My name is Wendi
- 15 Andrews. That's W-E-N-D-I; Andrews,
- 16 A-N-D-R-E-W-S. I'm going to reserve my comments
- 17 till later, if that's okay.
- MS. TAYLOR: Yes, thank you.
- MS. ANDREWS: Thank you.
- 20 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: We will move
- 21 on to Ms. Lucia Ibarra. If you unmute your mic,
- 22 you can begin.
- 23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Did you say
- 24 Gerald?
- 25 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: I'm sorry. We

- 1 were waiting to hear from Lucia.
- We will move on, and we will come back.
- 3 Or if you would like to leave a comment, there
- 4 will still be an opportunity to do so after we
- 5 call on all who have registered.
- 6 We will now move on to Ken Coffey, and
- 7 then we will also hear from Donald Rhodes
- 8 following that. Please unmute your mic,
- 9 Mr. Coffey, and you can begin by providing your
- 10 name and spelling your name for the record.
- MR. COFFEY: Good evening. My name is
- 12 Ken Coffey, K-E-N C-O-F-F-E-Y. I'm the executive
- 13 director of the Self Regional Healthcare
- 14 Foundation in Greenwood. And we have letters on
- 15 file from me representing our foundation and also
- 16 Self Regional Healthcare from Mr. Jim Pfeiffer,
- 17 who is the president and CEO.
- 18 Aside from the obvious benefits of
- 19 Enviva's \$20 million investment in the local
- 20 economy in Greenwood, this project will improve
- 21 efficiencies, increase production, and improve the
- 22 facility's overall environmental performance.
- 23 These are win-win improvements for Enviva and for
- 24 Greenwood. Enviva currently provides 80-plus
- 25 direct jobs and over 250 indirect jobs in the

- 1 region, resulting in a total economic impact of
- 2 \$115 million in the Greenwood community. The
- 3 increase in production that will occur if this
- 4 application is approved will also provide a boost
- 5 to the forest products sector by providing an
- 6 increased demand for wood fiber from local forest
- 7 owners, landowners, and wood suppliers.
- 8 Since their purchase in 19 -- in 2018,
- 9 Enviva has been and is committed to being a part
- 10 of the Greenwood community. Enviva participates
- in community events sponsored by the Greenwood
- 12 Chamber of Commerce, Greenwood Partnership
- 13 Alliance, Boys & Girls Club of the Lakelands
- 14 Region, Self Regional Healthcare, Preserving Lake
- 15 Greenwood, Piedmont Tech, and several other
- 16 organizations in the region. Most importantly, at
- 17 least from our perspective at the foundation, they
- 18 have stepped up in a big way by making a
- 19 charitable gift to Our Vision Is 2020 capital
- 20 campaign that has provided for a new childbirth
- 21 center and new surgery center on the campus of
- 22 Self Regional.
- 23 Enviva is a vital part of our
- 24 community. In addition to being excellent
- 25 corporate citizens, it's clear that they care

- 1 about making a difference in the future of our
- 2 community and as far as health care in our
- 3 community. And we have letters on file with you
- 4 all. And that would be the end of my remarks.
- 5 Thank you for the opportunity.
- 6 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you for
- 7 your comment.
- I see that Ms. Ibarra is back in the
- 9 group. I will call on her next and following will
- 10 be Don Rhodes.
- 11 Miss Lucia, please unmute your mic.
- 12 Provide your name with the spelling, and you can
- 13 provide your comment.
- 14 Okay. I think we may still be having
- 15 some technical difficulties, but we will move on
- 16 and we will come back to you, Miss Lucia.
- 17 We will now like to hear from Donald
- 18 Rhodes. Please unmute your mic. Mr. Rhodes, if
- 19 you are reaching us by phone, you can do so by
- 20 unmuting using star six or by hitting the
- 21 microphone on the toolbar to unmute your mic, and
- 22 you can provide your comments.
- MR. RHODES: Can you hear me now?
- 24 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 25 hear you now. Thank you.

- 1 MR. RHODES: Thank you for giving me
- 2 this opportunity to talk. I was at the meeting
- 3 that we had in town, and I'd like to appreciate
- 4 Tammy's presentation of the wood that she had
- 5 collected in her filter in her swimming pool. I
- 6 actually have a swimming pool myself. And another
- 7 neighbor up my street, Albert Cullens, which is --
- 8 he's deceased now. He was the first one that
- 9 called me about his situation, and I referred him
- 10 to DHEC. I've worked with DHEC before. I worked
- 11 with the South Carolina Regional Housing Authority
- 12 until the end of March of this year, so we have
- dealt with DHEC and other members in my line of
- 14 work.
- 15 It's appalling to see the things that's
- 16 going on in our community. When we go outside,
- 17 the dust is terrible. My wife has asthma. My
- 18 next door neighbor does. People on up the street
- 19 here have complained. We've all talked to each
- 20 other. This is a serious situation for us here in
- 21 our community. You have drainage from your nose
- 22 constantly. Your lungs, you can feel. You can
- 23 feel the dust as you breathe. You can see it in
- 24 the air early in the mornings. My wife and I has
- been out on our deck, and you can see it in the

- 1 air. Our cars are covered. When you take your
- 2 car to have it washed, the guy commented about
- 3 all -- he didn't know whether he could get the
- 4 wood off of the car. You can take your hands and
- 5 wipe it off the windows of your car, your vehicle,
- 6 anywhere you go outside. This is a real concern.
- We're elderly, late 70s, want to live
- 8 as long as we can. And I've never had lung
- 9 problems in my life, but I cough more now. You're
- 10 constantly sneezing, having to use nasal spray.
- 11 And I know it's coming for this community because
- 12 we see it. And I'm really concerned of the -- you
- 13 know, the -- our property here is going to be
- 14 devalued. Nobody's going to want to live in this
- 15 community. It's a serious situation.
- And I've worked with DHEC before, and
- 17 I've seen the results that you have got. But
- 18 we're pleading with you. If these people are
- 19 calling and saying all these wonderful things
- 20 about this company, come out here and live with us
- 21 and just --
- 22 (Timer sounds.)
- 23 -- go through what we're going through
- 24 here. And I appreciate you letting me have an
- 25 opportunity to speak. Thank you.

- 1 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you,
- 2 Mr. Rhodes.
- Ms. Lucia Ibarra, if you are now ready,
- 4 you can provide your comment.
- We will now move to Mr. Art Bush. And
- 6 following Mr. Bush, James C. Sanders, Junior.
- 7 Mr. Bush, please start by providing your name and
- 8 spelling of your name as well, and you can proceed
- 9 with leaving your comment.
- 10 Mr. James C. Sanders, Junior, if you
- 11 are ready, please unmute and you may provide your
- 12 comment.
- MR. SANDERS: Thank you, ma'am.
- 14 My name is James C. Sanders, Junior.
- 15 That's J-A-M-E-S, middle initial C, S-A-N-D-E-R-S,
- 16 Junior. I am a member of the Greenwood County
- 17 Forest Landowners Association, and I support
- 18 Enviva's efforts to increase the production of
- 19 their Greenwood County manufacturing facility.
- I consider myself to be a tree farmer.
- 21 I own and manage three small tree farms, one here
- in Greenwood County and two other tracts in
- 23 adjoining counties. My tree farms are primarily
- 24 devoted to the production of loblolly pine. I
- 25 plant my trees as small seedlings. I nuture them

- 1 and hope to harvest them some day in the same
- 2 matter as any farmer plants, nutures, and harvest
- 3 a crop. My tree farms are operated in accordance
- 4 with forest management plans approved by the
- 5 American Tree Farm System and the American Forest
- 6 Foundation. This certifies that my humble tree
- 7 farms are managed in an environmentally
- 8 sustainable manner. Tree farms like mine help
- 9 provide the raw material used in the production of
- 10 thousands of forest products and help in
- 11 supporting this state's vitally important forest
- 12 industries. Forest industries currently generate
- more than \$21 billion in annual economic activity
- 14 for South Carolina. Markets created by our
- 15 state's forest industries provide tree farmers
- 16 like me an economic incentive to maintain forest
- 17 management as our desired land use.
- 18 As a retired natural resource
- 19 specialist with the United States Department of
- 20 Agriculture, I understand the societal benefits of
- 21 forest as a land use. Markets for forest products
- 22 such as those provided by Enviva will help slow
- 23 the conversion of South Carolina's forest to more
- 24 intensive land use. I thank you for the
- opportunity to make my remarks.

- 1 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 2 Mr. -- I'm sorry. We'll now hear from
- 3 Ms. Lucia Ibarra. Are you available on the phone?
- 4 If so, please unmute by using star six.
- We'll now again call on Art Bush.
- 6 Mr. Bush, are you available?
- 7 We will now call on Cam Crawford. And
- 8 following Mr. Crawford, we will call on Dr. Gary
- 9 Harbour. Mr. Crawford?
- 10 MR. CRAWFORD: Yes. Can you hear me?
- 11 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes.
- MR. CRAWFORD: Okay. I'm Cam Crawford.
- 13 That's C-A-M C-R-A-W-F-O-R-D. I'm president of
- 14 the Forestry Association of South Carolina.
- On June 26th, the online edition of The
- 16 State paper published an op-ed I submitted calling
- 17 for South Carolina to adopt a new strategy for
- 18 forest conservation in the 21st century. In
- 19 essence, the op-ed pointed out that the
- 20 environmental movement is fighting a battle that
- 21 has already been won while ignoring the biggest
- 22 threat to forest conservation. Here are some key
- 23 points in the op-ed:
- 24 Conservation began with forestry more
- 25 than a century ago, leaving president Teddy

- 1 Roosevelt to state that the conservation movement
- 2 was, and I quote, "A direct outgrowth of the
- 3 forest movement, " end quote. During the 21st
- 4 century, the fight for forest conservation was due
- 5 to unsustainable timber harvesting practices. In
- 6 the 21st century, sustainability and environmental
- 7 stewardship are central components of the forest
- 8 products industry. The battle against
- 9 unsustainable timber harvesting has been won in
- 10 this state. There are 2 million more acres of
- 11 forestland today than in 1936. With increasing
- 12 development, projections are showing up to a
- 13 22 percent loss of forestland in the Piedmont
- 14 region by 2060.
- To be clear, urbanization is the
- 16 biggest threat to forest today, and private
- 17 landowners are essential in the efforts to
- 18 maintain and increase our forestlands. There are
- 19 currently 200,000 forest landowners in South
- 20 Carolina that will determine the future of forest
- 21 conservation in this state. So to encourage
- 22 private landowners to fully engage with forest
- 23 conservation, we must adopt a new strategy that
- 24 includes creating markets for landowners. If we
- 25 do not create markets for forest landowners, it

- 1 will result in the selling of timberlands to
- 2 developers.
- In the 21st century, here is the
- 4 question that the environmental movement must ask:
- 5 Is it better for a piece of property to remain as
- 6 a working forest or be used to expand urban
- 7 sprawl? With the huge budget deficit, the federal
- 8 government cannot be expected to buy sufficient
- 9 amounts of forestland to achieve the climate and
- 10 ecological outcomes that are so important.
- 11 Supporting private ownership of forestlands is the
- 12 most practical way to achieve climate and
- 13 ecological values that we cherish. To keep these
- 14 private lands as forests, landowners need viable
- 15 markets, including wood-based bioenergy.
- In closing, markets are important to
- 17 the private landowners since they provide the
- incentive to plant and manage healthy and
- 19 productive forests. These forests provide
- 20 countless environmental benefits for all South
- 21 Carolinians while providing the starting point for
- the \$21 billion forest products industry in South
- 23 Carolina. Since Enviva acquired the Greenwood
- 24 facility in spring 2018, Enviva has worked with
- 25 the community --

- 1 (Timer sounds.)
- 2 -- 1,000 South Carolina landowners for
- 3 wood fiber. This generated additional revenue for
- 4 South Carolinians to reinvest in their forestland.
- 5 Enviva is the world's largest producers of wood
- 6 pellets, and we are pleased to have them as a
- 7 member of the Forestry Association of South
- 8 Carolina. Thank you.
- 9 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 10 Thank you for your comments.
- We will proceed on with our next
- 12 participant, Dr. Gary Harbour.
- DR. HARBOUR: Hello.
- 14 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Unmute.
- DR. HARBOUR: Yes. Hello. Can you
- 16 hear me?
- 17 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, I can.
- 18 Thank you.
- DR. HARBOUR: My name is Dr. Gary
- 20 Harbour, G-A-R-Y H-A-R-B-O-U-R. I'm a Ph.D.
- 21 chemist with 35-year background in manufacturing
- 22 processes. I want to thank DHEC for the
- 23 opportunity to speak to the Enviva Greenwood
- 24 expansion permit.
- 25 Approval of this permit would not lead

- 1 to decreases of particulate matter pollution as
- 2 controls against particulates are not being
- 3 substantially improved. Especially concerning are
- 4 the sub 2.5 micro (technical difficulty), which
- 5 are known to cause significant pulmonary and
- 6 promotes cancer risks. Neighboring residents
- 7 report they can't go outside or get covered with
- 8 sawdust and associated particulates. The plant is
- 9 operating 24 hours a day, making the exposure time
- 10 very high.
- On top of that, this very Enviva plant
- 12 has a history of noncompliance. On May 8th, 2019,
- 13 the Enviva Greenwood plant was cited after an
- inspection by DHEC with eight major violations,
- 15 all of which could contribute with exceeding
- 16 permitted pollution levels.
- 17 A follow-up inspection on
- 18 September 24th, 2019, found a visible plume at
- 19 24 percent opacity, where the legal limit is
- 20 20 percent.
- Then on December 4th, 2019, a complaint
- of heavy visible emissions led an inspector to
- 23 find opacity at 79 percent, almost four times the
- 24 legal limit. Enviva was found to be using the
- 25 furnace bypass stack during a non-approved

- 1 operation. These inspections ultimately led to
- 2 Enviva voluntarily entering into a consent order
- on July 16th, 2020, only one month ago.
- 4 The inspection findings include failure
- 5 to maintain calibration data for major equipment,
- 6 like the dryer and the emission control devices
- 7 like the wet electrostatic precipitator used to
- 8 control particulate emissions; failure to document
- 9 causes and corrective actions when established
- 10 control parameters were violated; failure to
- 11 conduct weekly operations and maintenance checks
- 12 on major equipment; failure to record operational
- 13 control data; failure to submit required reports
- 14 to DHEC.
- 15 In short, Enviva is under consent order
- 16 for poor compliance in operation, maintenance,
- 17 recordkeeping, and their required reporting to
- 18 DHEC. Approval of this permit would result in
- increases in particulate matter pollution and CO2e
- 20 pollution. DHEC should not approve the requested
- 21 permit until Enviva addresses the additional
- 22 emissions and associated risk to the public.
- 23 Enviva's permit would allow them to increase their
- 24 production generating capacity --
- 25 (Timer sounds.)

- 1 -- while under a consent order only one
- 2 month old, which was triggered by their own
- 3 recidivist violation of pollution limits. The
- 4 permit should be denied under these circumstances
- 5 until they demonstrate the commitment and
- 6 capability to follow the regulations and their own
- 7 commitments. Thank you.
- 8 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 9 We'd like to ask at this time if you do
- 10 have your camera on and you are not --
- MR. BUSH: Yep.
- 12 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: -- speaking,
- 13 if you could --
- MR. BUSH: Yeah, yeah.
- 15 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: -- turn your
- 16 cameras off.
- 17 MR. BUSH: May I interrupt? Can you
- 18 hear me? Can you hear me?
- 19 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 20 hear you.
- 21 MR. BUSH: This is Art Bush, and I --
- there's a technical issue with some cell phones.
- 23 They don't unmute, and I was under the mute when
- 24 you called me before. And if you would allow me,
- 25 I'd like to speak.

- 1 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Mr. Bush, if
- 2 you would go ahead and restate your name and spell
- 3 it for the record and provide your comment.
- 4 MR. BUSH: Okay. My name is Art Bush,
- 5 and I'm interim CEO of the Greenwood Partnership
- 6 Alliance in Greenwood. And that's spelled A-R-T
- 7 B-U-S-H. And I'm calling in support of the permit
- 8 application of Enviva.
- 9 I've been listening to the calls, and I
- 10 understand the concerns of the members of the
- 11 community that surround the plant. But I also, as
- 12 a member of the Partnership Alliance, have been
- 13 working with Enviva for a couple of years now. I
- 14 know that they are dedicated in trying to find and
- 15 put in place a better process to improve the
- 16 emissions.
- 17 They've been active in the economic
- 18 development of Greenwood County. As said by
- 19 Mr. Coffey previously, they employ 18 members of
- our community, commit approximately \$115 million
- 21 to the Greenwood community. They also are very
- 22 active in the community and supporting things like
- 23 the Greenwood Chamber of Commerce, our own
- 24 Partnership Alliance, the Boys & Girls Clubs in
- 25 the Lakelands Region, Self Regional Hospital,

- 1 Preserving Lake Greenwood.
- 2 And I believe that their intent is to
- 3 spend \$25 million, potentially that number, to
- 4 improve the processes, to improve the quality of
- 5 the air, and also to increase production, which
- 6 helps them to pay the \$25 million which it takes
- 7 to do these improvements. So I believe that in
- 8 passing this permit will achieve the objectives of
- 9 the issues that the neighbors are having.
- 10 And I want to just thank Enviva for
- 11 their continued investment in Greenwood County and
- 12 South Carolina. And I want to thank you for this
- 13 opportunity to speak tonight. Thank you.
- 14 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 15 Miss Lucia, we see that your mic has
- 16 been unmuted. If you would like to go ahead and
- 17 provide your comment at this time.
- MS. IBARRA: Can you hear me now?
- 19 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 20 hear you. Yes. Thank you.
- MS. IBARRA: Oh, my God, finally.
- 22 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Begin by
- 23 stating your name and spelling it for the record.
- 24 MS. IBARRA: Yes. My name is Lucia
- 25 Ibarra, which is L-U-C-I-A; last name, I-B, as in

- 1 boy, A-R-R-A. I have a bachelor's of science in
- 2 wildlife habitat management and a master's degree
- 3 in organizational psychology. I speak to you
- 4 today with experience and knowledge of working in
- 5 the U.S. forest plan and as a biologist for
- 6 several governmental agencies. I am really
- 7 concerned about the wood pellet industry's impact
- 8 on South Carolina's communities, forests, climate
- 9 during this time of pandemic crisis. I'm here
- 10 today to urge DHEC to deny Enviva's air quality
- 11 permit to expand production in Greenwood, South
- 12 Carolina, and to complete a full environmental
- 13 justice report.
- 14 Approving this air quality permit means
- 15 that Enviva will expand production to 660 tons of
- 16 wood pellets per year, which means 15,800 acres of
- 17 forest cut per year, or to make it easier for you,
- 18 43 acres of forest cut per day. And this will
- emit 1,423 tons of CO2 per year, which equivalent
- of over 270-hundred-thousand extra cars on the
- 21 road. This is what this permit will do. This is
- 22 an environmental injustice for our communities and
- 23 our planet.
- On top of that, if this permit gets
- 25 approved, Enviva will attempt to increase their

- 1 softwood sourcing limit from 90 percent to a
- 2 hundred percent, which is already, like, high.
- 3 And as a result of increasing softwood uses, our
- 4 communities become more vulnerable to flooding.
- 5 Hurricane Florence, for example, caused
- 6 devastating flooding in some of the most heavily
- 7 loaded areas in South Carolina. Years of
- 8 investigations, like Tandy Taylor said, have
- 9 documented that Enviva sources whole trees, not
- 10 top of -- not limbs or wood that is not really
- 11 good -- from wetlands, from wetland forest, which
- 12 are ecological, important in sensitive ecosystem
- 13 and critical for flood control. And also
- 14 (inaudible) communities from flooding in reducing
- 15 costly property damages, and of course is water
- 16 filtration for our communities.
- 17 DHEC need to put attention on the fact
- 18 that natural forest and wetlands increase the
- 19 resiliency of flood-prone areas whereas the forest
- 20 deprivation, clearcut logging, and conversion to
- 21 plantations significantly decrease flood
- 22 protections and benefits to surrounding
- 23 communities.
- 24 (Timer sounds.)
- 25 We also know -- I'm almost done. So we

- 1 also know that carbon emissions remain in the
- 2 atmosphere for decades. And even new trees --
- 3 even though if new trees are planted as that
- 4 replacement rate.
- 5 Residents close to the plant are
- 6 complaining about the trucks, the noise, and the
- 7 dust, and the wood debris. Impact residents
- 8 deserve an opportunity to be informed about the
- 9 consequences of approving this permit and the real
- 10 meaning of expansion. We cannot deny that we're
- in a climate and a pandemic crisis. And current
- 12 (technical difficulty) electricity is not a
- 13 solution. It's our odd destruction. I'm asking
- 14 DHEC to deny this permit for Enviva's expansion.
- 15 Thank you.
- 16 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 17 Thank you very much for your comment.
- We will now move on to Sabrina Miller,
- 19 and following Ms. Sabrina Miller, Tim Adams.
- 20 Ms. Sabrina Miller, please unmute your mic if you
- 21 would like to provide your comments.
- MS. MILLER: Can everyone hear me?
- 23 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes.
- MS. MILLER: Okay. Good afternoon,
- 25 everybody. My name is Sabrina Miller, and I am

- 1 the executive director of the Boys & Girls Club of
- 2 the Lakelands. Enviva has been a staunch
- 3 supporter of the Boys & Girls Club of the
- 4 Lakelands since we came to the community about a
- 5 year ago. And besides being a valued employer of
- 6 many persons in Greenwood, Enviva is a great
- 7 corporate partner. This application for permit is
- 8 proof that they are committed to improving
- 9 conditions in the community by doing all they can
- 10 to not cause harm. We have more than 30 percent
- of our youth in Greenwood living below the poverty
- 12 line, and Enviva has donated generously to the
- 13 Boys & Girls Club to ensure that those youth who
- 14 otherwise would not have any opportunities to
- 15 improve their stations in life now have an
- 16 opportunity through programs that the Boys & Girls
- 17 Club provides that are staunchly supported by
- 18 Enviva through their generous donations of not
- 19 just financial support but also through
- 20 volunteerism, utilizing their staff to support any
- 21 projects that we have, but (technical difficulty)
- 22 mentors to our students, and just being a great
- 23 corporate partner to us.
- 24 So because of the great good that I
- 25 know Enviva continues to do in our community, I

- 1 would very much ask that DHEC would please approve
- 2 their application for permit. Thank you.
- 3 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 4 We will now call on Tim Adams.
- 5 Mr. Adams, please unmute.
- 6 MR. ADAMS: Can you hear me?
- 7 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: And you may
- 8 provide your comment. Yes.
- 9 MS. MILLER: Okay. Good evening. My
- 10 name is Tim Adams, T-I-M A-D-A-M-S. I'm speaking
- on behalf of the South Carolina Forestry
- 12 Commission in support of the Enviva air quality
- 13 permit. I have responsibilities for collecting
- 14 and analyzing forest resource data related to
- 15 forest sustainability.
- 16 First, to put things in perspective,
- 17 two-thirds of South Carolina is forested, that our
- 18 state is undergoing change as our population
- 19 grows. You have only to drive the interstate
- 20 corridor near Charleston and Greenville to see
- 21 that change for yourself. So far, forest land
- 22 base is stable at 12.9 million acres. And that's
- 23 refreshing news for the air we breathe and the
- 24 water we drink because the cleanest air and water
- 25 come from our forests.

- 1 Now, this public hearing is
- 2 specifically about air quality, and I'll say the
- 3 greatest threat to air quality related to forestry
- 4 is the loss of forestland acreage. For instance,
- 5 the I-85 corridor through the Upstate has lost
- 6 over 175,000 acres of forest over the past
- 7 25 years.
- 8 So how do we maintain our forests and
- 9 the ecosystem services that they provide? And
- 10 it's really quite simple. We create value for
- 11 forest landowners so they can afford to maintain
- 12 their land in forests. The primary economic value
- 13 that landowners receive comes from markets for
- 14 their timber products. The Greenwood area doesn't
- 15 have an abundance of markets, and that's reflected
- in the lower timber prices that landowners receive
- 17 in the Upstate. The Enviva pulpwood market allows
- 18 landowners to thin their pine stands for improved
- 19 health and vigor.
- Now, the ratio of timber growth to the
- 21 amount of annual harvest is the best measure of
- 22 forest sustainability, and the bigger the number,
- 23 the better. In Enviva's wood basket, the
- 24 growth-drain ratio is 2.1 for softwoods and 4.1
- 25 for hardwoods. So that means that twice as much

- 1 softwood and four times as much hardwood is being
- 2 grown as is harvested annually. Even with the
- 3 Enviva expansion, the Greenwood wood basket is
- 4 expected to continuing growing.
- I can summarize the forests' resource
- 6 as being sustainable: Our forests are balanced
- 7 with equal acreage of softwood and hardwoods.
- 8 Eighty-seven percent of the forests are
- 9 owned by private individuals.
- 10 And even with the expansion, pellet
- 11 production will only amount to just a little bit
- 12 over 1 percent of all the timber products that we
- 13 manufacture in South Carolina.
- Now, I started my remarks by saying
- 15 that the cleanest air and water come from our
- 16 forests. Forest landowners are providing these
- 17 ecosystem services to the public free of charge,
- 18 but they need healthy timber markets like Enviva's
- 19 Greenwood facility. Thank you for this
- 20 opportunity to comment.
- 21 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you for
- 22 your comment.
- We will now move to James S. Sanders,
- 24 Junior. Mr. Sanders, you could please unmute your
- 25 mic if you would like to provide your comment.

- 1 We will now call on Ken Leach, followed
- 2 by Reverend Leo Woodberry. Mr. Leach, would you
- 3 please unmute your mic and provide your name and
- 4 your comment. Thank you.
- 5 MR. LEACH: My name is Ken Leach, K-E-N
- 6 L-E-A-C-H. I live in Greenwood, and I'm retired
- 7 after a 40-year career in forestry. I currently
- 8 volunteer in various capacities and boards with
- 9 the South Carolina Certified Tree Farm Program,
- 10 the Forestry Association of South Carolina, the
- 11 Upper Savannah Land Trust, the Greenwood Forestry
- 12 Association, and Keep Greenwood County Beautiful.
- 13 I returned in nine -- in 2015 to
- 14 Greenwood after accepting the position of
- 15 procurement manager for the pellet mill being
- 16 built by Colombo Energy. Procurement manager is
- 17 responsible for the acquisition of the fiber to
- 18 feed the mill. Colombo was Enviva's predecessor.
- 19 My task was to build a supply chain to support the
- 20 operation and get that wood certified to the
- 21 various sustainability standards required in the
- 22 global pellet market. Several studies were
- 23 conducted to verify the presence of a sustainable
- 24 wood in the fiber supply to support the operation.
- What I have found when I arrived were

- 1 tree farmers, landowners, loggers, and wood
- 2 suppliers who were anxious to see another market
- 3 for their low-grade wood or pulpwood. I spoke to
- 4 landowners and loggers who couldn't get wood cut
- 5 due to the lack of consistent markets. A supply
- 6 chain was in place and certification to four
- 7 internationally-recognized sustainability
- 8 standards were required to sell to the world
- 9 pellet market were secured for the startup in late
- 10 2016.
- In the past five years, this region has
- 12 been -- has seen periodic shifts in demand for
- 13 wood due to mill closures, changes in production,
- 14 or changes in the species consumed. These ongoing
- 15 changes are unsettling to landowners and suppliers
- in the region. The presence of the pellet mill
- 17 offers another market for the wood, and has been a
- 18 positive and stabilizing influence for pulpwood
- 19 harvesting.
- 20 As with any industry, commissioning and
- 21 startup of a new facility is not without
- 22 challenges. My experience has been that both
- 23 Colombo and Enviva tackled every challenge in a
- 24 very professional manner, striving to meet air
- 25 permit requirements. As Enviva's markets develop

- 1 worldwide, I'm sure they will be very keen to see
- 2 that any permitting required to meet those goals
- 3 were exceeded with the same intensity and
- 4 professionalism that I experienced during my
- 5 employment. I ask you to support Enviva's air
- 6 quality permit. Thank you.
- 7 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 8 Reverend Woodberry, please unmute and
- 9 provide your comment.
- 10 REV. WOODBERRY: Thank you. Thank you
- 11 very much. My name is Leo Woodberry, L-E-O
- 12 W-O-O-D-B-E-R-R-Y. I am the executive director of
- 13 New Alpha Community Development Corporation, which
- 14 is a member of the South Carolina Environmental
- 15 Justice Network, and I also serve as a board
- 16 member for Dogwood Alliance. I'm coming to you at
- 17 this time in order to request that DHEC deny the
- 18 permit to expand the Enviva plant at Greenwood.
- 19 And I was very pleased to hear at the
- 20 beginning of this hearing that DHEC is tasked with
- 21 looking after the public health of the citizens of
- 22 South Carolina because so many of the comments
- 23 made are based with -- based on wealth rather than
- 24 concern for the health of the citizens of
- 25 Greenwood and surrounding areas. When we look at

- 1 the permit requesting expansion, we note that they
- 2 are endeavoring to put controls in place that will
- 3 reduce HAPs, VOCs, and controlled dust, even
- 4 though we know that there is a history of
- 5 violations of emissions emitted by the plant.
- 6 So when we look at the place that we
- 7 are currently in right now in South Carolina and
- 8 our nation, when COVID is spiking in South
- 9 Carolina and ravaging our communities, from a
- 10 public health perspective we know that people who
- 11 suffer from respiratory problems are more
- 12 susceptible to contract COVID-19 and,
- 13 unfortunately, to become fatalities.
- 14 When we look at the fact that Enviva
- 15 needs to put in place a better business management
- 16 plan that is known to the community, that they
- 17 need to conduct an environmental justice analysis
- 18 so that we can see the impacts on the community
- 19 and the health of its members. We need to look at
- 20 the fact that particulate matter will still be
- 21 spread throughout the community on logging trucks
- 22 as they travel through the roads, that we need
- 23 better dust control both outside of the facility
- 24 and inside of the facility. And with the
- 25 emissions, because there's still going to be

- 1 emissions even though they're reducing, especially
- with the expansion of production, we need to look
- 3 at the fact that stacks need to be increased in
- 4 height so that the VOCs and HAPs are emitted
- 5 higher in the atmosphere and thus produce a lower
- 6 risk for the citizens of Greenwood and surrounding
- 7 areas.
- I have to say at this time when people
- 9 are struggling to breathe, from children to our
- 10 seniors --
- 11 (Timer sounds.)
- 12 -- and noting the multiple violations
- 13 that the Enviva plant has done as recently as a
- 14 month ago that more controls, better management
- 15 practices need to be put in place before this
- 16 permit can be approved. Thank you very much.
- 17 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you,
- 18 Reverend Woodberry.
- 19 We would now like to call on Craft
- 20 Hollingsworth. Mr. Hollingsworth, if you could
- 21 please unmute your mic.
- Mr. Hollingsworth, if you would like to
- 23 provide a comment now, you can do so by unmuting
- 24 your mic. We have some instructions on the screen
- 25 on how to do so.

- 1 We will now move on and call on Dallas
- 2 Conyers.
- REV. CONYERS: Hello. Can you hear me?
- 4 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 5 hear you. Thank you.
- 6 REV. CONYERS: My name is Reverend
- 7 Dallas Conyers. That is spelled D-A-L-L-A-S
- 8 C-O-N-Y-E-R-S. I am currently the program
- 9 coordinator for South Carolina Interfaith Power
- 10 and Light. I am also speaking as a sustainable
- 11 agriculturist, beekeeper, licensed husbandman, and
- 12 permaculturist.
- 13 I've heard a lot tonight that makes me
- 14 want to go off script of my proposed topic, but I
- 15 am still saying please do not approve this permit.
- 16 As Reverend Woodberry said, most of the pro
- 17 comments are centered around economics. But
- 18 economics does nothing for this latest generation
- of children, who are the first generation in over
- 20 200 years whose life expectancy is actually
- 21 shorter than the generation before them. All of
- 22 this progress has resulted in genetic and
- 23 environmental harms that are so egregious that we
- 24 are shortening our life spans, and our children
- 25 are the ones paying for it. We must stop looking

- 1 at money as a motivator when the generation of
- 2 that money is harming and killing the people that
- 3 it's supposed to be supporting.
- 4 I've heard many comments about health
- of forests. And the fact of the matter is the
- 6 forest that they're talking about are largely
- 7 monocultures, which are not working forests.
- 8 Working forests are supposed to be diverse,
- 9 supporting many forms of life and, therefore,
- 10 creating and sustaining naturally the biodiversity
- 11 necessary to create a healthy environment not just
- 12 for the animals and plants that live in it but
- 13 also for the humans that live in, live nearby
- 14 them.
- 15 These are not the cases in these
- 16 forests that they're talking about. These forests
- 17 have been stripped bare of most of the
- 18 biodiversity, and that is why so many of the trees
- 19 are unhealthy; not because too many trees are
- standing, but because there's too much human
- 21 interference in those lands as it is.
- 22 We need to look at the fact that when
- 23 we see companies like this operating, the areas in
- 24 which they operate are usually poor or places of
- 25 color. You do not see this near the operator's or

- 1 the people who create these businesses homes
- 2 because they know that they don't want them near
- 3 their homes. I heard one person say that the
- 4 community will understand. That tells you both
- 5 that, number one, they don't live in the community
- 6 and, number two, the community is suffering. They
- 7 know the community is suffering. And they're
- 8 saying eventually they'll understand. When will
- 9 the community understand? When their medication
- 10 bills surpass any money they're getting from
- 11 working in Enviva or working in that area? Will
- 12 they understand when their children's medical
- 13 bills surpass any money given by Enviva or when
- 14 their child has to go to the hospital instead of
- 15 to the new Boys & Girls Club or expanded Boys &
- 16 Girls Club?
- 17 We need to stop using money as a lynch
- 18 point as people are dying, as we're shortening our
- 19 life.
- 20 (Timer sounds.)
- 21 And we need to ask ourselves when God
- looks upon the creation that he called good and
- 23 told us to be stewards of it, will they be able to
- 24 answer him with a book and ledger of our accounts
- or will he look at us and see how we affected his

- 1 creation and his other children that look just
- 2 look us? Thank you for allowing me to speak.
- 3 Please do not approve this permit. Look to your
- 4 morality and look to whether or not you would want
- 5 to live next door to Enviva. Thank you.
- 6 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 7 We will now call on Chris Brown,
- 8 followed by Heather Hillaker. Mr. Brown, please
- 9 unmute and you could provide your comment.
- MR. BROWN: Hello. Can you hear me?
- 11 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes.
- MR. BROWN: Thank you. Yes, I am Chris
- 13 Brown. I am Enviva's community relations manager.
- 14 I support this permit since it will allow Enviva
- 15 to enhance and improve its operations in Greenwood
- 16 County. This is a good thing for a great
- 17 community.
- In my role, I have the honor of working
- 19 closely with nonprofit organizations in the
- 20 communities that Enviva operates. These
- 21 nonprofits are staffed by like-minded individuals
- 22 who share the same basic goal of improving the
- 23 lives of others in their community. I am proud to
- 24 be one of the newest board members for the Boys &
- 25 Girls Club of the Lakelands Region, and we're all

- 1 excited about the new Josh Norman Teen Center that
- 2 is due to open this fall. It will be an awesome
- 3 asset for Greenwood County.
- 4 The collective energy of the
- 5 individuals that I work with has no limits, but
- 6 budgets and volunteers do. My good friend,
- 7 Sabrina Miller, who you heard from earlier is with
- 8 the Boys & Girls Club, and she's a classic example
- 9 of this. Last year Enviva signed on to sponsor a
- 10 family fun event for the children of the Boys &
- 11 Girls Club close to the Christmas holiday. Upon
- 12 my arrival with a fellow Enviva employee, Sabrina
- asked us if we're going to observe or participate.
- 14 I replied that we were there to volunteer. So for
- 15 the next two hours, I made reindeer out of plastic
- 16 cups while my associate helped children decorate
- 17 cookies. It was a fun and rewarding time, and
- 18 it's something that we do all the time at Enviva.
- 19 Enviva's relationship continued to grow
- 20 with the Boys & Girls Club as we became one of the
- 21 first corporate sponsors of the new Josh Norman
- 22 Teen Center that is set to open, as I said, this
- 23 fall. That new center is poised to serve over
- 24 1,000 boys and girls annually, providing countless
- opportunities for the youth of Greenwood. In

- 1 addition to our work with the Boys & Girls Club, I
- 2 am personally engaged with volunteer efforts and
- 3 sponsorships with nearly a dozen different
- 4 nonprofit organizations in the Greenwood area,
- 5 from cleaning up Lake Greenwood to sponsoring
- 6 events with Greenwood Chamber of Commerce.
- 7 In closing, Enviva cares about our
- 8 communities. We're engaged. We invest in our
- 9 communities. That's what we do here in Greenwood
- 10 and throughout the Greenwood enterprise. Thank
- 11 you very much for the opportunity to provide
- 12 comments tonight.
- 13 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you very
- 14 much.
- 15 Ms. Heather Hillaker?
- MS. HILLAKER: Hi. Can you hear me?
- 17 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes.
- 18 MS. HILLAKER: Thank you. My name is
- 19 Heather Hillaker; last name, H-I-L-A-K-E-R. And
- 20 I am an attorney with the Southern Environmental
- 21 Law Center. In addition to written comments that
- 22 will be submitted jointly with the Environmental
- 23 Integrity Project, I am providing oral comments
- 24 tonight to highlight a few specific issues with
- 25 the draft permit and this facility.

- 1 The draft permit at issue tonight
- 2 involves an expansion and modification to the
- 3 existing Enviva Greenwood facility. As part of
- 4 this modification, Enviva plans to install
- 5 additional pollution control technologies that
- 6 will decrease several pollutants. Not all
- 7 pollutants, however, will decrease. In
- 8 particular, by permitting Enviva to expand
- 9 production by over 100,000 tons per year and
- 10 increase itself with content to a hundred percent,
- 11 the draft permit would also allow Enviva to
- 12 increase emissions of hazardous and toxic air
- 13 pollutants, including formaldehyde.
- 14 The increase in production allowed
- 15 under the draft permit will have other harmful
- 16 impacts to nearby communities. Increased
- 17 production at the pellet mill will mean more truck
- 18 and rail traffic, which will in turn increase
- 19 pollution, dust, odor, and noise. Recent aerial
- 20 photographs of the facility showed dozens of
- 21 logging trucks lined up at one time to unload
- 22 trees at the facility.
- 23 Additionally, as we've heard tonight,
- 24 residents living closest to the facility have
- 25 expressed concerns over the amount of dust and

- 1 soot in the air from Enviva's current operations.
- 2 This will only be exacerbated by the proposed
- 3 expansion. These impacts will threaten the health
- 4 and quality of life for people living near the
- 5 plant.
- 6 Additionally, according to the
- 7 information provided in the permitting documents,
- 8 it appears that the Enviva Greenwood facility has
- 9 been illegally operating as a major source of
- 10 nitrogen oxide and carbon monoxide for the past
- 11 few years. Enviva's permit application
- 12 acknowledges that the previous owners, Colombo
- 13 Energy, failed to quantify emissions from all
- 14 sources at the facility, emissions which Enviva is
- 15 now incorporating as part of the pending permit.
- 16 As shown plainly in the chart provided in Enviva's
- 17 own application, when all of the emission sources
- 18 are properly accounted for, emissions of NOx and
- 19 CO exceed the major source threshold under the
- 20 Clean Air Act's Prevention of Significant
- 21 Deterioration Program. The facility does not,
- 22 however, have a major source permit and has not
- 23 undergone pre-construction review as required
- 24 under state and federal air quality laws. While
- 25 NOx and CO emissions will decrease as a result of

- 1 the proposed modification, that does not change
- 2 the fact the facility has been illegally operating
- 3 as a major source for the past few years and will
- 4 continue to do so until the proposed control
- 5 technologies are installed and operational, which
- 6 may not be for another year. Accordingly, DHEC
- 7 should take the appropriate enforcement action
- 8 against the facility for operating a major source
- 9 of NOx and CO in violation of the Clean Air Act.
- 10 I look forward to expanding on these
- 11 and other issues in our written comments, and I
- 12 encourage DHEC to listen carefully to the
- 13 complaints being made tonight by those living
- 14 nearby to the -- nearby to the facility and to
- 15 take those issues into account when evaluating
- 16 Enviva's proposal. Thank you.
- 17 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 18 We'll now move on to Chief Parr. Chief
- 19 Parr, if you would like to comment, please unmute
- 20 your mic or star six using your phone.
- 21 We will now call on Luke Penney. Luke
- 22 Penney?
- MR. PENNEY: Yes. Can you hear me?
- 24 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes. Thank
- 25 you.

- 1 MR. PENNEY: All right. My name is
- 2 Luke Penney. That's L-U-K-E P-E-N-N-E-Y. I am
- 3 the president of the Abbeville County Landowners
- 4 Association and a forestry consultant. I am in
- 5 support of Enviva's proposed expansion and air
- 6 quality permit at their Greenwood pellet facility.
- 7 The Enviva mill purchases pulpwood from
- 8 private landowners in Abbeville and surrounding
- 9 counties. Landowners in Abbeville County and
- 10 throughout the Piedmont of South Carolina have a
- 11 need for pulpwood markets to maintain the health
- 12 and vigor of their forests. The Enviva mill sits
- in a location that gives it the ability to have a
- 14 positive impact on stumpage values, which drive
- 15 the incentive for reforestation and healthy forest
- 16 management.
- 17 The Piedmont region of the southeast
- 18 has suffered from fragmentation. A byproduct of
- 19 fragmentation is urbanization and development. A
- 20 strong timber market is one of the better tools to
- 21 help curb fragmentation of forest landscapes and
- 22 development while maintaining and creating more
- 23 forested land. Forest landowners in Abbeville
- 24 County have made a long-term investment in trees
- 25 which provide clean air, water, and wildlife

- 1 habitat and quality of life for residents.
- 2 The majority of the timber harvested
- 3 for the Enviva mill comes from thinning stands of
- 4 timber. Thinning removes diseased and
- 5 poor-quality trees, enhancing the health and
- 6 viability of the remaining stand of trees. A
- 7 healthy tree is less receptive to pest, disease,
- 8 and drought.
- 9 I appreciate the opportunity to provide
- 10 my comments. Thanks.
- 11 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 12 We'll now move on to Florence Anoruo.
- 13 The last name is spelled A-N-O-R-U-O. If you
- 14 would like to provide your comment, please unmute
- 15 your microphone at this time.
- We will now call on Annemarie Humm,
- 17 followed by Trip Chavis. Annemarie, please unmute
- 18 your mic at this time to provide your comment.
- 19 Thank you.
- MS. HUMM: Thank you. My name is
- 21 Annemarie Humm, A-N-N-E-M-A-R-I-E H-U-M-M. I am
- 22 here to speak on behalf of several neighbors that
- 23 live very close to the Enviva plant in Greenwood.
- 24 Some are very frustrated and many are intimidated
- 25 and too shy to speak publicly about their

- 1 concerns, and few do not know where to turn for
- 2 help. That's why they asked me to help with their
- 3 complaint and also with the public comment.
- 4 We oppose the expansion at the Enviva
- 5 Greenwood plant. We think that we are not getting
- 6 heard and that big business, local organizations,
- 7 and the local government are working together to
- 8 ignore the simple people living in the area around
- 9 the plant. We also need to remember there is
- 10 Woodfields Elementary School close by, and nobody
- 11 has spoken up for the children that go to the
- 12 school every day.
- I will stick to the major concerns and
- 14 complaints told by Rita Deloach, Michael Ginn,
- 15 Forest Alexander, Gale and Donnie Hentz, Donna and
- 16 Wilbert Hicken, and Connie Martin. Other than the
- 17 dust and particulates in the air which settle on
- 18 everything -- especially the cars, the trucks or
- 19 personal vehicles, metal buildings, the property
- 20 owners' yards -- the noise is a big issue.
- 21 Comfort is being outside -- comfort of being
- 22 outside is limited by the dust particulates which
- 23 are in the air and are being breathed in along
- 24 with the pumping and the grinding noise of the
- 25 plant, especially at night, being the hammering,

- 1 the train car noises, and the horn blowing when
- 2 the train cars are moved, especially from 4 till
- 3 7 a.m., as Donny Hentz told me.
- 4 Fires have happened several times, and
- 5 smoke and musty pine odor is noticed by Michael
- 6 Ginn and Gale Hentz. "One never knows what is
- 7 next, "Gale said. The constant truck traffic, the
- 8 consequent road dust pollution, and the wood
- 9 debris from the transportation trucks are a
- 10 constant eyesore. Several residents have filed
- 11 complaints with DHEC before and have even been
- 12 visited by the department representative, only to
- 13 be told there's nothing they could do.
- We are fed up being ignored and overrun
- 15 by non-caring government officials, DHEC, and the
- 16 big businesses building up all around us. We feel
- 17 trapped. We urge you to keep our air clean; our
- 18 nights quiet, so we and our children can sleep;
- 19 and our areas safe from fire hazards, black smoke
- 20 plumes floating through the air above us.
- 21 (Timer sounds.)
- 22 Musty odors and (technical difficulty)
- 23 perfumes coming from the constant lines of trucks.
- 24 Most of us have lived here before the plant
- opened, and Enviva has been neglectful in our need

- 1 for clean air and a comfortable living
- 2 environment. Thank you.
- 3 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 4 Mr. Trip Chavis, please.
- 5 MR. CHAVIS: Thank you. My name is
- 6 Trip, T-R-I-P; Chavis, C-H-A-V-I-S. I am the
- 7 president and CEO of Milliken Forestry Company of
- 8 South Carolina, land management consulting firm.
- 9 And I'm here tonight to speak in support of
- 10 Enviva's air quality permit to enhance and expand
- 11 its facility in Greenwood.
- 12 The permit represents a
- 13 \$20-plus-million investment in Greenwood. It will
- 14 enable the facility to be more efficient, increase
- 15 production, and improve its overall environmental
- 16 performance. With a current estimated total
- 17 economic impact of \$115 million to the Greenwood
- 18 community, the increase in production will provide
- 19 a boost to the forest products sector while
- 20 providing an increased demand for wood fiber from
- 21 private landowners. The capacity increase at
- 22 Enviva Greenwood means increased market
- 23 opportunities for South Carolina family landowners
- 24 to provide several hundred thousand additional
- tons of sustainably grown wood to green energy.

- 1 Markets are important to private landowners
- 2 providing the incentive to plant and manage
- 3 healthy and productive forests that provide
- 4 countless environmental benefits for all of South
- 5 Carolinians.
- 6 Through their commitment to
- 7 sustainability and improve forest health, Enviva
- 8 has been and currently is an advocate and consumer
- 9 of certified wood. Enviva and Milliken strongly
- 10 support certification of working forests under the
- 11 American Tree Farm System and/or the Forest
- 12 Stewardship Council programs. These certification
- 13 programs require monitoring and proof that
- 14 harvested forests are replanted and sustainable.
- 15 Lastly, I believe the proposed
- 16 expansion will support well-managed forests and
- 17 improve forest health. Enviva uses forest
- 18 products that allow a market for foresters to be
- 19 able to remove and monetize trees that are
- 20 diseased, unhealthy, and of poor quality, focusing
- 21 future forest growth on high-quality trees and
- 22 well-managed stands providing environmental
- 23 benefits that only a healthy South Carolina forest
- 24 can provide.
- I appreciate the opportunity to provide

- 1 comment.
- 2 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- We'll now call on Craft Hollingsworth.
- 4 Craft Hollingsworth?
- 5 MR. HOLLINGSWORTH: Yes. Can you hear
- 6 me?
- 7 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 8 hear you.
- 9 MR. HOLLINGSWORTH: Okay. My name is
- 10 Croft Hollingsworth. That's C-R-O-F-T
- 11 H-O-L-L-I-N-G-S-W-O-R-T-H. And I'm the plant
- 12 manager at Enviva's Greenwood facility. I have
- 13 lived and worked in Greenwood for nearly 25 years
- 14 except for the two years in which my wife and I
- 15 lived and worked in Oregon. Enviva provided us
- 16 the opportunity to return to Greenwood area to be
- 17 closer to our kids and the community which we very
- 18 much enjoy.
- 19 I lead a team of 80 men and women at
- 20 Enviva Greenwood. Many started with limited skill
- 21 sets and have been able to grow personally and
- 22 professionally thanks in part to our company's
- 23 discipline and commitment to operational
- 24 excellence. I also have the privilege of working
- 25 alongside dozens of local area businesses that

- 1 make up our supply chain, and they all share our
- 2 passion for healthy forests and thriving and
- 3 healthy community.
- 4 This permit is about enhancing emission
- 5 controls at the plant, which will reduce its
- 6 emissions further and allow us to moderately
- 7 increase production. These enhancements represent
- 8 a positive economic benefit for our partners and
- 9 the local supply chain including forest
- 10 landowners, loggers, local sawmills, truckers,
- 11 mechanics, and other service providers. I care
- 12 about Greenwood: my team at the plant, my
- 13 neighbors, and my community. I've always been an
- 14 active community member, volunteering for many
- 15 organizations and many activities. I also served
- on the board of Beyond Abuse for many years. I'm
- 17 passionate about ensuring Enviva is doing
- 18 everything it can to be a good neighbor.
- 19 As the plant manager, it is my
- 20 responsibility to ensure the plant is compliant
- 21 with our permits and that we follow regulatory
- 22 requirements. And we take that responsibility
- 23 seriously, putting great effort, time, and
- 24 investment in our team and resources to ensure
- 25 environmental compliance. With the enhancements

- 1 to the facility, we will be investing nearly 28
- 2 million in additional equipment and environmental
- 3 controls all aimed at making the plant run more
- 4 efficiently and reducing our emissions. This
- 5 permit would increase our total investment in the
- 6 community to over \$150 million. Every dollar we
- 7 spend in Greenwood creates an economic impact that
- 8 generates additional salaries, taxes, revenue for
- 9 landowners, and spending in our community.
- I fully support this permit and
- 11 encourage DHEC to approve it. As the plant
- 12 manager and, more importantly, as a longtime
- 13 resident of Greenwood, you have my commitment that
- 14 we will continue to operate this plant
- responsibly, be a good neighbor, and be a positive
- 16 member of the Greenwood community. Thank you.
- 17 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 18 Chief Parr, we would like to now call
- 19 on Chief Parr.
- 20 CHIEF PARR: Hello? Can you hear me?
- 21 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 22 hear you.
- 23 CHIEF PARR: Can you hear me? Hello?
- 24 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes. Please
- 25 proceed.

- 1 CHIEF PARR: Okay. I thank y'all for
- 2 letting me be here tonight. I oppose this permit.
- 3 I'm the chief of the Pee Dee Indian Tribe in South
- 4 Carolina, one of the chiefs. And it's a shame
- 5 that we have not learned nothing in 200 years.
- 6 The more people, they talk about the wealth and
- 7 the -- what they're doing for the community, but
- 8 they're not talking about the community itself,
- 9 that people are dying because of the lack of --
- 10 lack of protection. When the storms come through,
- 11 our trees protect us. They -- we have more floods
- 12 now.
- 13 Please, do not give them a permit.
- 14 Thank you.
- 15 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you for
- 16 your comment.
- 17 We'll now move on to Loretta Slater.
- MS. SLATER: Hello?
- 19 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 20 hear you.
- 21 MS. SLATER: Okay. My name is Loretta
- 22 Slater. And that's L-O-R-E-T-T-A; Slater is S in
- 23 front of "later." That's the simple part of it.
- 24 I'm of the Whitney M. Slater Foundation, Kingdom
- 25 Living Temple Church, and New Alpha CDC, and South

- 1 Carolina EJ Network.
- I heard all the comments that was said.
- 3 I would like to say this is not a formality for
- 4 y'all. It's business. It's business. Well, for
- 5 me, it's not that. It's a person -- it's personal
- 6 to me. In 2011, I lost my only child, died due to
- 7 illness that related to sickness when we was
- 8 living in the close -- of a plant and a lot of
- 9 pollutions was going on there. She contracted,
- 10 you know, sickness where -- at the age of 19 and
- 11 passed away at the age of 21. Everybody is
- 12 talking about -- about the wealth and money and
- 13 all that. But it went -- when it comes to a
- 14 mother that lost her only child and will never be
- 15 a grandmother, that hits hard.
- I do not want this plant to get a
- 17 permit because family, people over money any day.
- 18 So that's my comments at this time. So please
- 19 think about that, everybody, when a mother is
- 20 suffering.
- 21 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you,
- 22 Miss Loretta, and so very sorry about your loss.
- We will move on with calling on
- 24 Alectron Dorfman, followed by Erniko Brown.
- MR. DORFMAN: Yes. Can you hear me?

- 1 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Alectron,
- 2 please provide your comment --
- MR. DORFMAN: My name is Alectron
- 4 Dorfman. That's spelled A-L-E-C-T-R-O-N
- 5 D-O-R-F-M-A-N. And I'm the chairman of the
- 6 Lakeland Citizens for Clean Air, Incorporated. We
- 7 were formed after we started to receive reports
- 8 about what was happening in the form of
- 9 particulates and dust and a rain of sawdust that
- 10 was coming down on residents within a mile of the
- 11 plant that existed. We investigated these reports
- 12 and started talking to people in their
- 13 neighborhood, and they told us stories of how they
- 14 can't sit out in their yard, how their children
- 15 cannot play in their yards, how they -- how their
- 16 cars were covered in sawdust one hour after they
- 17 returned home from work.
- 18 And these kinds of stories are not
- 19 being addressed here right now by the folks who
- 20 want to only talk about the financial benefits
- 21 that this plant brings to the community. Of
- 22 course this organization, this company, is putting
- 23 out money throughout the community. They're the
- 24 world's richest pellet production plant. They
- 25 have plenty of money, and they're going to spread

- 1 it around while, on the other hand, they're
- 2 polluting this community. And they are doing
- 3 that, as is evidenced by the fact that they have
- 4 been in violation of the Clean Air Act since
- 5 they've been in operation.
- Now, we have particulate sensors of our
- 7 own sourced around the lake, and we do see at
- 8 night, generally, when Enviva is running in full
- 9 production that those plants at times emit two --
- 10 160 particles of 2.5 particulates in a --
- 11 throughout a 10-minute cycle. Every 10 minutes,
- 12 we're seeing 160. That is not air that is clean
- 13 debris. And those sensors are 5 miles to the
- 14 northeast of those -- of that plant, 5 miles.
- 15 So we ask DHEC do not approve an
- 16 additional production of particulates that will
- 17 affect this community in such a negative way. I
- 18 thank you.
- 19 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 20 Erniko Brown?
- MS. BROWN: Yes, ma'am. Can you hear
- 22 me?
- 23 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, ma'am.
- 24 Thank you.
- MS. BROWN: No, thank you.

- Good evening, everyone. My name is
- 2 Erniko Brown. And I'm from McCormick, South
- 3 Carolina, but I currently live here in Greenwood,
- 4 about 5 miles from the Enviva plant. A couple of
- 5 years ago I learned of this plant as part of my
- 6 previous position as a career coach for SC Works.
- 7 And like many others, I thought that bringing more
- 8 jobs to the community would be what's best for the
- 9 community. As a career coach for the WIOA and SC
- 10 Works, my position was to assist individuals with
- 11 the skills they needed like sending them back to
- 12 school, finding employment, or both.
- I did not know the cost of humanity for
- 14 these jobs being placed in the community. These
- 15 plants are strategically being placed in
- 16 low-income communities where people are already
- 17 trying to figure out how to pay their bills, put
- 18 food on their tables, and maintain a healthy
- 19 mental balance to get through the day. Many of
- 20 the children who live in these targeted
- 21 communities are predominantly minorities with
- 22 underlying health issues, with parents who do not
- 23 know the harm that it -- that has entered into
- 24 their community.
- 25 Enviva employs many people who aren't

- 1 from South Carolina, so they do not know much
- 2 about the beautiful natural resources that we
- 3 have. When people who live in these communities
- 4 hear the word "expansion," they think that it
- 5 means more jobs, a better economy for the
- 6 community. Many do not know that this expansion
- 7 does not include jobs, and it's inclusive of more
- 8 harmful air pollutants that will cause more health
- 9 issues for people in these targeted low-income
- 10 communities.
- 11 Most of my life has been in some part
- 12 of South Carolina. And all the places that I have
- 13 lived are included in that 70- to 75-mile radius
- 14 that Enviva currently desecrates. Me being from
- 15 McCormick, I appreciate clean air, the water, the
- 16 trees, the state parks that provide beauty and
- 17 history. All these wonderful natural resources
- 18 protect us from climate change. The forest
- 19 protects us from ourselves.
- The people like myself who have lived
- 21 here most of our lives do not want to see these
- 22 resources beaten and bruised by big corporations
- 23 for a few dollars. Lives here are at stake and
- 24 people are not up for sale. I live in this
- community, and it's a smack in the face to me and

- 1 my existence. It is in a large part of
- 2 environmental racism and continues to separate the
- 3 haves from the have-nots. We are all a part of
- 4 one race, the human race, and should have more --
- 5 and should have a more equitable future for all of
- 6 us ahead.
- 7 I doubt if, excuse me, the people here
- 8 today holding this hearing live in the area that's
- 9 being affected by pollution, but I think if you
- were or your family or your community, what would
- 11 you do or want to see? We're already dealing with
- 12 a global --
- 13 (Timer sounds.)
- 14 -- pandemic that has cost us the lives
- of so many. Why would we want to continue to put
- 16 more in harm's way?
- 17 Many people who live in -- many people
- 18 who live close to the Enviva plant don't have
- 19 access to Internet and aren't able to attend this
- 20 virtual hearing. We live in a rural area, and
- 21 many folks don't have access to broadband, which
- 22 could be the reason that many of them aren't here.
- 23 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Ms. Brown?
- MS. BROWN: Yes.
- 25 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Will we --

- 1 could we ask that you complete that statement, and
- 2 we would need to move on in order for everyone to
- 3 be able to provide comment tonight. But,
- 4 certainly, you can provide additional comments in
- 5 writing.
- 6 MS. BROWN: Okay. The last thing I had
- 7 was as a state, we say, "While I breathe, I hope."
- 8 With industries like this coming into our state
- 9 and all of the clearcutting and leaving forests
- 10 and wooden areas damaged and torn apart, we cannot
- 11 breathe. And without that, there is no hope.
- 12 Thank you.
- 13 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 14 We'll now move on by calling Elizabeth
- 15 Kress, followed by Patrick Anderson. Elizabeth
- 16 Kress?
- MS. KRESS: Hello. My name is
- 18 Elizabeth Kress. I have 17 years of employment
- 19 experience working as an engineer with a variety
- of renewable energy projects for utility in South
- 21 Carolina. While, you know, solar wind and storage
- 22 are exciting technologies, biomass is an important
- 23 resource. And I believe that biomass will be even
- 24 more important in the future.
- I have a very good understanding of how

- 1 our forests and timberlands are held in South
- 2 Carolina. It's important that we have markets for
- 3 wood in order to keep our forests. If landowners
- 4 can't sell trees to pay taxes and property
- 5 management, our forests will be sold off. And
- 6 these are private landowners, for the most part,
- 7 in our state.
- 8 So having studied the potential for
- 9 biomass to energy in South Carolina, along with
- 10 the benefits and detriments of biomass and all
- 11 other alternative energy sources, here is what I
- 12 have learned:
- We have an adequate forest resource in
- 14 South Carolina to support Enviva's plant and even
- 15 more, especially when these are spread out into
- 16 the areas where wood markets are needed.
- 17 The timber markets provide a
- 18 substantial number of good jobs and income to
- 19 private landowners in the local economy.
- 20 Biomass and pellets for energy provide
- 21 a substantial carbon benefit over the coal that
- 22 was being used in UK and Europe.
- Biomass products and energy should be
- 24 supported by people who truly care about the
- 25 environment and people who take the time to

- 1 understand the forestry and biomass processes.
- 2 For these reasons and more, I support
- 3 granting the permit to Enviva. Thank you very
- 4 much.
- 5 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 6 Patrick Anderson?
- 7 MR. ANDERSON: Hi. Can you hear me?
- 8 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes.
- 9 MR. ANDERSON: Thank you.
- 10 Hello, my name is Patrick Anderson.
- 11 That's P-A-T-R-I-C-K A-N-D-E-R-S-O-N. I'm an
- 12 attorney with the Environmental Integrity Project.
- 13 I will also be providing written comments prepared
- 14 together with the Southern Environmental Law
- 15 Center.
- But I want to point out a few key
- 17 issues. First, I want to be clear that although
- 18 the project includes new pollution controls, even
- 19 with these controls the expansion will lead to an
- 20 increase of several harmful pollutants. And, yes,
- 21 while particulate matter emissions from the plant
- 22 smokestacks are projected to decrease, they will
- only decrease by just 3 percent. Meanwhile, the
- 24 fugitive dust that we've heard so much about
- 25 tonight will certainly increase.

- 1 As DHEC has heard tonight and over the
- 2 past several years, numerous neighbors have made
- 3 complaints about this fugitive dust, these
- 4 emissions from the plants. This is consistent
- 5 with what neighbors at most other Enviva plants
- 6 report time and again, and it's unacceptable.
- 7 Fine wood dust is not only a nuisance, it's a
- 8 health hazard. Numerous medical studies have
- 9 demonstrated that.
- 10 So while I appreciate that DHEC
- 11 recently required Enviva to reevaluate its
- 12 fugitive dust management plan, the fact is that
- 13 the details of this plan have not been made
- 14 available to the public for notice and comments,
- 15 and it's doubtful the plan will be sufficient to
- 16 eliminate these harmful fugitive dust emissions.
- 17 Because this dust problem is the main
- 18 concern neighbors have expressed to DHEC, the
- 19 permit at issue tonight should itself contain
- 20 specific, detailed, and enforceable operating
- 21 practices; maintenance schedules; and better
- 22 monitoring to mitigate or hopefully eliminate this
- 23 harmful fugitive dust. Without these
- improvements, DHEC should deny the expansion.
- One other thing I wanted to discuss is

- 1 this facility's history of violations for failing
- 2 to follow key operating and monitoring conditions
- 3 of its existing permit. DHEC recently issued a
- 4 compliance order over many significant violations
- 5 that occurred on dozens or even hundreds of
- 6 occasions. Most significantly, these violations
- 7 include unauthorized circumvention of existing
- 8 pollution controls that lead to substantial levels
- 9 of excess emissions. Unfortunately, many of these
- 10 violations were only discovered because DHEC
- 11 happened to conduct unannounced inspection at the
- 12 right time.
- 13 To this end, DHEC needs to issue this
- 14 facility's Title 5 federal operating permit as
- 15 soon as possible. DHEC was legally required to do
- 16 so over a year ago but has not. Title 5 federal
- 17 operating permits are crucial because they must
- 18 contain adequate monitoring, recordkeeping, and
- 19 recording requirements to ensure compliance with
- 20 all applicable requirements. Issuing the legally
- 21 required Title 5 permit would be a significant
- 22 step towards ensuring Enviva's future compliance
- 23 and also to make sure that violations are not only
- 24 discovered --
- 25 (Timer sounds.)

- 1 -- when DHEC happens to be on site.
- Thank you. That's all I have for you
- 3 tonight.
- 4 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 5 We will now call on Nathan McClure,
- 6 followed by Varis Woodberry. Nathan, please
- 7 unmute, and you can provide your comment. Thank
- 8 you.
- 9 MR. BRIGGS: Hey, Monica. Nathan let
- 10 us know that he wasn't gonna be able to hang
- 11 around, and he provided his comments in written
- 12 form.
- 13 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 14 Virus -- I'm sorry, Varis Woodberry.
- 15 Mr. Woodberry, if you would like to provide a
- 16 comment, please unmute.
- We'll move on to Jimmy Corley. Jimmy
- 18 Corley?
- MR. CORLEY: Yes. Can you hear me?
- 20 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 21 hear you. Thank you.
- MR. CORLEY: Okay. Jimmy Corley,
- 23 J-I-M-M-Y C-O-R-L-E-Y. I work with Crawford's
- 24 Contracting Services, and we are in favor of the
- 25 Enviva air construction permit.

- 1 As a contractor, we work at a lot of
- 2 different facilities, mostly in chemical plants
- 3 around the Augusta area. But for over the last
- 4 year we have also had work inside the Enviva
- 5 Greenwood facility. During that time we've done a
- 6 lot of work on various jobs, a lot of which are
- 7 for visual improvements to the facility, safety
- 8 improvements, and also environmental improvements.
- 9 I'd like to note that, as stated before, Enviva
- 10 did not build this facility, but they are
- 11 committed to move forward and improve and better
- 12 their facility. I see this throughout a lot of
- 13 the jobs that we get and are doing at their
- 14 facility.
- 15 So we see this expansion as a positive
- 16 move for not only the facility but also the
- 17 community and the environment. And that's really
- 18 all I have. Thank you for the opportunity to
- 19 comment, and we are in favor.
- 20 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- We will now call on Stephen Stroud.
- 22 Please unmute and provide your comment.
- MR. STROUD: Yes. Can you hear me now?
- 24 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes, we can
- 25 hear you. Thank you.

- 1 MR. STROUD: Good evening. My name is
- 2 Stephen Stroud, S-T-E-P-H-E-N S-T-R-O-U-D. I am
- 3 the director of environmental affairs with Enviva
- 4 and over the last 12 years have spent my career
- 5 working in environmental permitting for the
- 6 natural resources and wood product industries. At
- 7 Enviva, I lead our environmental permitting
- 8 affairs. And Enviva is a data-driven company that
- 9 has and continues to make substantial investments
- 10 in environmental control technologies to reduce
- 11 our environmental footprint in the communities
- 12 where we operate. I'm here tonight to speak on
- 13 behalf of the company in support of the proposed
- 14 air permit for the Greenwood plant and, most
- 15 importantly, I'm here to address key air quality
- 16 points that this permit will cover.
- 17 This permit will allow us to install
- 18 new control equipment and utilize a more robust
- 19 controls as it pertains to the emissions from our
- 20 dry hammermills. The permit will reduce all
- 21 ozone-forming compounds: nitrogen oxide, carbon
- 22 monoxide, and volatile organics as well as
- 23 particulate matter of PM, PM10, and PM2.5.
- 24 Ultimately, this results in a lessened
- 25 environmental footprint and cleaner air in the

- 1 community.
- 2 This permit has gone through a thorough
- 3 technical review with DHEC which included all
- 4 emission calculations, regulatory analysis, and
- 5 ambient air quality modeling. The air quality
- 6 modeling results show compliance with all ambient
- 7 air quality standards in the future state of the
- 8 facility. This permit also includes stringent
- 9 compliance testing. And this investment of
- 10 capital and our company's resources' allocations
- 11 demonstrate our strong environmental and
- 12 compliance leadership in the industry as the
- 13 world's largest wood pellet manufacturer.
- 14 Recently, DHEC installed two fine
- 15 particulate matter ambient air quality stations of
- 16 PM2.5 in close proximity to our facility. The
- 17 monitoring conducted by DHEC is for the entire
- 18 surrounding area, not solely of the Enviva
- 19 facility. The data collected by these monitors
- 20 demonstrates that the current air ambient quality
- 21 is well below the federal standards and
- 22 significantly less than historic fine particulate
- 23 ambient air quality standards monitors that was
- 24 conducted in Greenwood, South Carolina --
- 25 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's been more

- 1 than three minutes. This is way beyond anyone
- 2 else's, and you're just reading.
- 3 (Timer sounds.)
- 4 MR. STROUD: This facility has and
- 5 always has operated with a valid and legal
- 6 operating permit. Thank you for the opportunity
- 7 to speak and address the public as it pertains to
- 8 this application.
- 9 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you for
- 10 your comment.
- 11 And we would like to remind
- 12 participants we would like for you to please
- 13 continue to have your mics muted while others are
- 14 providing comments.
- We will now move on with Jaime
- 16 Wisinggarver.
- 17 MS. WISEGARVER: Hi. My name is Jaime
- 18 Wisegarver. That's J-A-I-M-E W-I-S-E-G-A-R-V, as
- 19 in Victor, E-R. And I'm an attorney with the U.S.
- 20 Industrial Pellet Association or USIPA. USIPA is
- 21 a not-for-profit trade association. We're based
- 22 in Richmond, Virginia. USIPA promotes
- 23 sustainability and safety practices within the
- 24 U.S. wood energy industry. Our membership
- 25 includes large-scale producers of sustainable wood

- 1 biomass across the southeast. Enviva is one of
- 2 our founding members.
- 3 As you consider Enviva's permit
- 4 application, I would like to emphasize to the
- 5 Department of Health and Environmental Control
- 6 that leading scientific authorities and real world
- 7 data confirm the positive benefits of wood biomass
- 8 for the climate, our environment, and rural
- 9 economies just like Greenwood. According to the
- 10 world's foremost climate experts, wood bioenergy
- 11 limits global warming by replacing fossil fuels
- 12 and keeping our forests intact. This was the
- 13 conclusion of the UN Intergovernmental Panel on
- 14 Climate Change, the IPCC, which is widely
- 15 considered to be the global authority on climate
- 16 science. The IPCC makes clear that forests and
- 17 forest products have an essential role to play in
- 18 mitigating climate change.
- In its August 2019 special report on
- 20 land and climate, the IPCC indicated that
- 21 bioenergy and sustainable forestry are critical
- 22 components in keeping the earth's warming below
- 23 1.5 degrees celsius. Specifically, the IPCC
- 24 stated that sustainable forest management, quote,
- 25 "Aimed at storing carbon while yielding timber,

- 1 fiber, and bioenergy will produce the best results
- 2 for the climate." Wood biomass also benefits the
- 3 environment by strengthening the market for
- 4 forestry. It provides additional income to
- 5 landowners to help them keep planting trees versus
- 6 converting their land to other uses. It's because
- 7 of these strong markets that data from the U.S.
- 8 Department of Agriculture shows that forest
- 9 inventory, an area in the United States southeast,
- 10 have steadily increased since the mid 1950s, and
- 11 forest carbon stocks have more than doubled.
- Wood biomass is a meaningful but small
- 13 part of the overall forest economy. It accounts
- 14 for only 3 percent of all wood harvested each year
- 15 across the southeast. Thus, it's easy to see why
- our forests continue to remain stable, productive,
- 17 and healthy, even as they provide a steady supply
- 18 of renewable forest products, which include
- 19 biomass.
- 20 Finally, biomass provides a vital
- 21 support of economic support for communities like
- 22 Greenwood. Enviva has already invested millions
- of dollars in South Carolina, and its Greenwood
- 24 plant currently supports more than 250 jobs.
- 25 Enviva estimates that it creates a total annual

- 1 economic impact in the region of approximately
- 2 \$115 million.
- 3 (Timer sounds.)
- 4 The science and the facts show us that
- 5 an approved permit and expansion at the Greenwood
- 6 facility would allow Enviva to continue fighting
- 7 climate change and, thus, we support the approval
- 8 of the permit. Thank you very much.
- 9 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- 10 We now call on Brandon Smith. Brandon
- 11 Smith?
- We'll move on to Brad Thompson. Brad
- 13 Thompson, Junior?
- MR. THOMPSON: Can you hear me?
- 15 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes.
- MR. THOMPSON: Thank you so much. This
- 17 is Brad Thompson, Junior. That's spelled B-R-A-D
- 18 T-H-O-M-P-S-O-N. Thank you for the opportunity.
- I live in Greenwood, and I represent
- 20 the South Carolina Chapter of the Association of
- 21 Consulting Foresters. We are a national
- 22 organization of advisors to forest landowners.
- 23 It's highly likely that a consultant forester has
- 24 been involved at some point in the management of
- 25 almost every private forest in South Carolina. A

- 1 consultant forester serves as the primary advisor
- 2 to private landowners. We help these owners
- 3 plant, grow, and market their timber. The growth
- 4 of our business has actually mirrored the growth
- 5 and forest cover in South Carolina, because it's
- 6 well-known that forestland cover in South Carolina
- 7 has increased dramatically over the past
- 8 100 years. We are proud that our clients are from
- 9 all income levels and races. It goes without
- 10 saying that we all seek sustainability, whether
- 11 it's sustainable forestry or sustainable
- 12 manufacturing.
- 13 I'm here to offer our association's
- 14 support for Enviva's air quality permit. We know
- 15 that increased production in Enviva provides
- 16 private landowners confidence in keeping their
- 17 forests as forests. Urbanization and
- 18 fragmentation in the Upstate are leading to less
- 19 forestland. Fragmentation of forests reduces
- 20 their ability to maintain forest health and
- 21 provide ecosystem services such as clean water,
- 22 wildlife habitat, carbon sequestration, and clean
- 23 air. Again, I'll say it again. Fragmentation of
- 24 forests reduces forest ability to maintain forest
- 25 health and provide ecosystem services such as

- 1 clean water, wildlife habitat, carbon
- 2 sequestration, and clean air.
- 3 Enviva's timber demand does not
- 4 encourage landowners to clearcut mature timber.
- 5 Actually, what Enviva's demand has allowed us
- 6 foresters to grow mature forests and actually keep
- 7 those mature forests healthy from drought and
- 8 insect threats. These forests are highly diverse
- 9 and host an array of wildlife. Every property
- 10 that we manage has a hunting club paying for the
- 11 right to hunt land. There's almost zero turnover
- 12 among these clubs, so there must be a great deal
- of wildlife there for them to enjoy pursuing and
- 14 for feeding their families.
- 15 There's no -- there's no wood mill more
- 16 diligent in ensuring that harvesting is done
- 17 sustainably with regard to water quality, so I am
- 18 surprised really to hear these comments attacking
- 19 Enviva's environmental practices. Trees used by
- 20 Enviva today were planted a decade or more in the
- 21 past. We support the continued investment in
- 22 forest products manufacturing --
- 23 (Timer sounds.)
- 24 -- to give landowners confidence in
- 25 keeping their forests as forests for decades to

- 1 come. I thank you so much.
- 2 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you.
- We will now go back to Ms. Wendi
- 4 Andrews. If you would like to provide a comment
- 5 at this time, Ms. Andrews, we'd like to call on
- 6 you.
- 7 MS. ANDREWS: Yes. Thank you. My name
- 8 is Wendi Andrews. That's W-E-N-D-I A-N-D-R-E-W-S.
- 9 So I reserved my comments because I was
- 10 listening to -- I wanted to have an opportunity to
- 11 get -- to listen to the input from the community
- 12 as far as what they were thinking, both those of
- 13 the forestry industry that has more knowledge than
- 14 I do, as well as the concerned citizens in the
- 15 community. So having listened to all of that, I
- 16 will say that, you know, I am concerned about the
- 17 air quality. I represent the Food Bank of
- 18 Greenwood County, and our focus is addressing food
- insecurity to the residents of Greenwood County.
- 20 We focus primarily on our most vulnerable
- 21 populations, our children and our senior citizens.
- 22 So I have -- I've listened to the concerns of the
- 23 neighbors, and that concerns me as well.
- 24 Having said that, I also know very well
- 25 Croft Hollingsworth, who is the plant manager of

- 1 Enviva. And I've had the pleasure of meeting
- 2 Chris Brown. So having listened to all of the
- 3 concerns and the violations, I know that those two
- 4 gentlemen will work diligently to improve the
- 5 processes that are great concerns as far as the
- 6 pollutants in the air for the community because
- 7 they are concerned about those around them. And
- 8 if this expansion can help improve the air
- 9 quality, then I support that 100 percent. So I'm
- 10 going to trust that they're going to do what they
- 11 said that they're going to do and that they're
- 12 committed, as I know that they are personally.
- 13 And for that reason, I'm going to support
- 14 providing the permit for Enviva.
- 15 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Thank you for
- 16 your comment.
- 17 At this time, I want to just give you a
- 18 brief reminder that if you have not been able to
- 19 provide your full comment tonight in the time
- 20 allotted, you can do so by contacting us at the
- 21 address provided on the screen now, and you can
- 22 provide your comment in writing. For those who
- 23 may have had any issues unmuting, you can also
- 24 provide comments via the address that we have
- 25 provided. We also have a phone call-in number if

- 1 there is an issue with unmuting via your computer.
- 2 Please feel free to call in to the number that we
- 3 have provided on the screen. This has given us
- 4 multiple ways to reach out to everyone who would
- 5 like to comment during this hearing. So we wanted
- 6 to make sure that you all had all of this
- 7 information.
- 8 This now concludes everyone who has
- 9 preregistered to speak. Before we begin to hear
- 10 from other attendees who have decided that they
- 11 would like to comment, our tech host, Lawra Boyce,
- 12 will give instructions on commenting from your
- 13 remote location. Lawra?
- 14 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Yes. Thanks,
- 15 Monica.
- So as Monica noted, it is important
- 17 that we hear from all of you who are interested in
- 18 commenting in the time we have tonight. There are
- 19 two ways to comment or request to speak: You can
- 20 raise your hand by clicking on the hand icon in
- 21 the floating toolbar or you can unmute your line,
- 22 and we will know to call on you. If you're
- 23 dialing into the meeting from your phone, press
- 24 star six to unmute instead of using the phone's
- 25 mute button. By pressing star six, it allows us

- 1 to know that you would like to speak.
- Once you've unmuted, please refrain
- 3 from speaking until you are called on by either
- 4 your name or the last four digits of your phone
- 5 number. If we experience a lot of background
- 6 noise, we may need to mute lines. So when it is
- your turn to speak, please clearly state and spell
- 8 your name. If for some reason you are
- 9 experiencing difficulty with muting or unmuting
- 10 your line, we do encourage you, as Monica said, to
- 11 submit your comments via e-mail to
- 12 airpncomments@dhec.sc.gov or mail to the addresses
- that have been provided on the web page in the
- 14 public notice and on the screen right now on Slide
- 15 29.
- 16 Also, as Monica mentioned earlier,
- 17 anything typed into the chat box is subject to be
- included in the record of the public hearing.
- 19 However, it would not be considered an official
- 20 comment. We encourage all written comments to be
- 21 submitted via e-mail or mail at the addresses
- 22 provided.
- 23 So with that, we will go ahead and get
- 24 started. I will call on those who have indicated
- 25 they would like to speak. And the first one that

- 1 we will call on is Carol Quarrels. Ms. Quarrels,
- 2 please unmute your line and begin by stating your
- 3 name clearly. Ms. Quarrels, you will have three
- 4 minutes once you begin.
- Okay. We'll try to come back to
- 6 Ms. Quarrels.
- Next, we will go to phone number ending
- 8 in 2604. 2604, please state your name and spell
- 9 it for the court reporter, and then proceed with
- 10 your comment.
- MR. BOATRIGHT: Hello. Yes, this is
- 12 Xavier Boatright, X-A-V-I-E-R B-O-A-T-R-I-G-H-T.
- 13 I'm with the Sierra Club's Beyond Coal Campaign.
- 14 I'm an organized representative. And I have --
- 15 and I apologize for that. I have -- and I just --
- it's shocking to me to hear the comments from
- 17 these neighbors. I spent some time in North
- 18 Carolina around the Northampton facility, there's
- 19 an Enviva plant there, and knew many allies in
- 20 that community who say some of these same things.
- 21 And I just feel as though right now
- 22 with our current COVID reality, the folks talking
- 23 about wealth, I think we need to, before approving
- 24 this permit -- I'm opposing this permit at this
- 25 time because before we can move forward with any

- 1 expansions, I think we have to attend to these
- 2 issues that we're hearing from the community
- 3 today. I believe in loving thy neighbor. I know
- 4 we say Enviva is doing their best, but if you look
- 5 at their other plants, some of the known
- 6 violations at the Greenwood plant but also at
- 7 other facilities.
- 8 And the replication of these narratives
- 9 at their other facilities, there is a true issue
- 10 with the dust. And according to a Harvard School
- of Public Health, increased long-term exposure to
- 12 fine particulate matter can lead to increased
- 13 COVID death. And so with our current reality
- 14 right now, these folks, it sounds like these
- 15 neighbors, these South Carolinians, they need help
- 16 from, you know, Enviva. They're doing their best,
- and we need to support Enviva to completely
- 18 protect these folks from the existing
- infrastructure before we can move forward.
- 20 So I urge DHEC not to approve this
- 21 permit until we can best protect these neighbors
- 22 and the folks who are living by it and encourage
- others to develop dialogue and relationships with
- 24 the community to learn how we can best protect our
- 25 fellow South Carolinians. Thank you for this time

- 1 and opportunity.
- 2 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Thank you.
- 3 Our next speaker will be phone number
- 4 ending in 5134. Please state your name clearly,
- 5 and you will have three minutes to present your
- 6 comment. Phone number 5134.
- 7 MS. GREENLAW: Okay. All right. So
- 8 you can hear me?
- 9 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Yes, we can.
- 10 Please proceed.
- 11 MS. GREENLAW: Okay. My name is Pamela
- 12 Greenlaw. And I've been watching for a while how
- 13 agencies such as DHEC handle things in different
- 14 ways. There is a way to look at what's going on
- 15 around us that is beyond just the pencil pushing
- 16 here.
- 17 I'm going to -- I want to urge
- 18 communities and nonprofits to watch the film
- 19 called "Dark Waters." It's about corporate
- 20 investments in communities that give with one hand
- 21 and take away with the other. I don't doubt at
- 22 all the sincerity of the volunteers who are
- 23 employees of Enviva when they go and they want to
- 24 help with the Boys & Girls Club. That's
- 25 wonderful. But that's not the reason for the

- 1 existence of Enviva, and they have to put first
- 2 things first. Corporations often will establish
- 3 foundations and they collect donations so they can
- 4 do the good deeds. But they're not -- Enviva
- 5 right now is not operating in good faith. We see
- 6 that there have been multiple noncompliance
- 7 issues, serious ones.
- 8 I'm going to refer to what I'm working
- 9 on with the people here in South Carolina, and
- 10 that's the Westinghouse nuclear fuel fabrication
- 11 plant. The Air Bureau might do well looking at
- 12 what DHEC's site assessment remediation area is
- 13 doing. They put together a consent agreement, and
- 14 they expected, they expected Westinghouse plant to
- 15 pony up and do right. And guess what, they're
- 16 doing it. They've collected additional -- they've
- 17 put out extra monitors that actually give solid
- 18 scientific data. They've had it assessed,
- 19 analyzed independently. And they are moving
- 20 forward slowly.
- The Westinghouse plant, of course, it's
- 22 not, you know, forestry, but it's just a case in
- 23 point. They are -- they put in a permit
- 24 application. They withdrew it. They're redoing
- 25 it. This is what I suggest Enviva does. They

- 1 have the money to do this. They just purchased --
- 2 they're expanding in Georgia and Mississippi.
- 3 They're making money hand over fist. They're
- 4 sending pellets overseas, where the pellets are
- 5 burned, and they're polluting. So that's -- it's
- 6 not just polluting here, polluting over there
- 7 where they're being burned.
- 8 So we really have to call them to
- 9 account, ask them to remove the permit, to expand.
- 10 Make them behave. Make them do what they're
- 11 supposed to do. Take care of the community.
- 12 (Timer sounds.)
- 13 It doesn't help -- I'm sorry. Let me
- 14 finish this. You can't have parts of the
- 15 community that are helped and other parts that are
- 16 throwaway. We call those "sacrifice zones." The
- 17 people who are disposable don't get -- aren't
- 18 getting help from DHEC if you're insisting that
- 19 the particulate, the dust that they're dealing
- 20 with, is something you cannot handle. Yes, you
- 21 can. Get some help.
- But I do not support this permit at
- 23 this time. They need to withdraw it. And you
- 24 need to call them to account, make them do the
- 25 right thing. Thank you very much.

- 1 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Thank you,
- 2 Ms. Greenlaw.
- 3 Our next person up to comment is phone
- 4 number ending in 8008. 8008, please state your
- 5 name clearly and proceed with your comment, and
- 6 you will have three minutes.
- 7 MS. CESAFSKY: Hi, good evening. My
- 8 name is Kim Cesafsky, K-I-M C-E-S, as in Sam, A-F,
- 9 as in Frank, S-K-Y. And I'm the director of
- 10 sustainability policy for Enviva. By way of
- 11 background, I have masters' degrees in forestry
- 12 and environmental management from Duke University,
- and I'm an expert in forest supply chains and
- 14 sustainability. I'm here tonight to speak in
- 15 support of this permit and share my views on
- 16 sustainability at Enviva.
- 17 We at Enviva, we're proud to be a part
- 18 of the robust and longstanding southern forest
- 19 products industry, which is our country's oldest
- 20 natural resource industry and, arguably, our
- 21 biggest sustainability success story. We take
- 22 great care to ensure that our plants are located
- in areas with an abundant supply of wood from
- 24 working timberlands and that our sourcing
- 25 practices support the health, longevity, and

- 1 carbon storage potential of southern forests. We
- 2 do this in a responsible, safe, and sustainable
- 3 manner.
- 4 The benefits of biomass are clear.
- 5 Good biomass like Enviva's comes from wood sourced
- 6 sustainably as a byproduct of a traditional timber
- 7 harvest from a region with stable or increasing
- 8 forest carbon stocks. According to data from the
- 9 U.S. Forest Service, we can confidently state that
- 10 forest inventory and, thus, forest carbon storage
- 11 is increasing in all of our sourcing regions.
- 12 Each year across the U.S. south, only 2
- 13 percent of the working forestland is harvested,
- 14 while the remaining 98 percent of the forestland
- 15 continues to grow and store carbon. And biomass
- 16 demand makes up only 3 percent of the total amount
- of wood harvested across the south every year.
- 18 Specific to South Carolina, forests are
- 19 growing there faster than they're being harvested.
- 20 Across the nearly 13 million acres of working
- 21 forestland in the state, they're adding carbon
- 22 year over year. For every 1 ton of wood removed
- 23 from the forest every year in South Carolina,
- 24 another 1.26 tons of woods are regrowing. Enviva
- 25 also doesn't purchase wood from any harvest that

- 1 will not return to forest after the harvest has
- 2 taken place, and that's a requirement of our
- 3 responsible sourcing policy.
- 4 Turning to climate benefits and
- 5 sustainable bioenergy, it's important to point out
- 6 that leading academics and climate scientists
- 7 worldwide, they agree that markets supported by
- 8 wood bioenergy protect and grow forests. The
- 9 UN IPCC wrote a report in 2018 explaining that --
- 10 you know, I guess now today we only have ten years
- 11 to mitigate the worst effects of climate change,
- 12 and bioenergy is included in every single one of
- 13 their pathways towards a desirable future. The
- 14 scientific experts in energy systems the world
- 15 over recognize that biomass is really one of the
- 16 pillars of a sustainable climate future. And,
- 17 also, forward-thinking countries, they're
- 18 recognizing this and they've turned to bioenergy
- 19 to meet their climate commitments. In Europe,
- 20 biomass represents more than 60 percent of
- 21 renewable energy consumption, and it's a key part
- of the strategy for meeting ambitious carbon
- 23 reduction goals.
- I invite you all to take a look at
- 25 Enviva's responsible sourcing policy and to hold

- 1 us accountable for doing what we said we would do.
- 2 (Timer sounds.)
- We're proud of -- we're proud of our
- 4 record of conserving forests, investing in
- 5 restoration, and assisting landowners in
- 6 certification. We look forward to being part of
- 7 the South Carolina community for years to come.
- 8 Thank you very much.
- 9 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Thank you.
- 10 Our next speaker is Mr. Mike Meetze.
- 11 Mr. Meetze, please speak your name clearly, spell
- 12 it for the court reporter, and proceed with your
- 13 comment. You will have three minutes.
- 14 MR. MEETZE: Yes, ma'am. My name is
- 15 Michael Meetze. Meetze is spelled M-E-E-T-Z-E.
- 16 And I'm the chairman of the State Tree Farm
- 17 Committee. I'm also a landowner in Newberry
- 18 County. And I'm also a registered professional
- 19 engineer that began his career at DHEC, 1980.
- 20 We're -- I'm here as a representative of the Tree
- 21 Farm System in South Carolina to support the
- 22 Enviva expansion. The South Carolina Tree Farm
- 23 System is a grassroots organization of family
- 24 farms, representing approximately a thousand
- 25 members, representing also about 350,000 of

- 1 certified acres, that being certified to standards
- 2 that meet any of the new green -- green issues.
- 3 As stated earlier, Enviva has been a
- 4 great corporate community member and has provided
- 5 additional outlets for underutilized wood. The
- 6 key to manage and sustaining a forest as to
- 7 sequest the most carbon as possible is keeping
- 8 that forest growing and healthy. A nongrowing
- 9 forest does not sequest carbon. It actually
- 10 starts releasing it after it starts dying.
- 11 The pellet mill helps with climate
- 12 change in two ways: by keeping a growing forest
- 13 and keeping it sequestering carbon to its fullest
- 14 extent; and, also, the pellets are used as a
- 15 substitute for coal, which also helps with climate
- 16 revisions.
- 17 Again, I'm in support of Enviva's
- 18 expansion and appreciate the opportunity to get to
- 19 speak tonight. Thank you.
- 20 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Thank you,
- 21 Mr. Meetze.
- Ms. Slater, we see that you have your
- 23 hand raised, and you've already spoken. We want
- 24 to make sure we have enough time for others to
- 25 speak. But is there somebody else with you that

- 1 may be interested in speaking?
- MS. SLATER: Yes.
- 3 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Okay. Make
- 4 sure you get close to the microphone, and state
- 5 your name clearly for the court reporter. You
- 6 will have three minutes.
- 7 MR. WOODBERRY: My name is Varis
- 8 Woodberry. It's spelled V, as in Victor, A-R-I-S;
- 9 last name Woodberry, W-O-O-D-B-E-R-R-Y. I am with
- 10 Kingdom Living Temple and New Alpha CDC. I do not
- 11 support the permit for Enviva. I already
- 12 submitted my comment, and I have no further
- 13 comment. Thank you.
- 14 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Thank you,
- 15 Ms. Woodberry.
- Next, we have Jim Potts, who has
- 17 indicated he would like to speak. Mr. Potts,
- 18 please state your name clearly for the court
- 19 reporter, and you will have three minutes.
- 20 MR. POTTS: Jim Potts. Can you hear
- 21 me?
- TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Yes, sir.
- MR. POTTS: Okay. It's J-I-M
- 24 P-O-T-T-S. I'm a forest consultant for 55 years.
- 25 And nobody has expressed the biological growth of

- 1 forests and the carbon sequestered.
- 2 But loblolly pine, which is basically
- 3 what Eniva and most pulp mills around here use,
- 4 have roughly the life cycle of humans. The
- 5 teenagers are the fastest growing trees, and
- 6 they're the ones that sequestered the carbon.
- 7 Once the trees get 25 to 30 years old, like
- 8 humans, they start deteriorating and going
- 9 downhill. Once the trees get 50 to 60 years old,
- 10 they start using more oxygen than they -- than
- 11 they put out because of all the rot and the limbs
- 12 and the bark and everything that's rotting from
- 13 the bacteria and the other creatures that are
- 14 eating and rotting in the wood. So if trees
- 15 aren't thinned, then they will deteriorate a lot
- 16 faster than normal. And if you go into a forest
- 17 that's over 25 or 30 years old that's never been
- thinned, there's rot laying all on the ground
- 19 everywhere. So we need to be able to thin the
- 20 trees.
- 21 And they only clearcut when they reach
- 22 maturity, and that's 25, 30, 40 years old. And
- 23 they almost always planted them back in South
- 24 Carolina, and we plant more back than we cut. And
- that's why we're growing more wood every year than

- 1 is being cut. So to keep the forests healthy, we
- 2 must have a market to thin out the diseased, the
- 3 crooked, and the trees that are suppressed so that
- 4 the others can grow and be healthy and not get
- 5 pine needles and the other diseases and bugs that
- 6 get into the trees. Thank you.
- 7 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Thank you.
- 8 Is Lynn Hendricks on the line? Lynn
- 9 Hendricks is the next to speak. If you are able
- 10 to unmute, it's star six. Also, if you're on the
- 11 computer, you can push the microphone icon to
- 12 unmute. You will have three minutes. Please
- 13 state your name clearly for the court reporter.
- 14 Lynn Hendricks.
- 15 Okay. We might come back to
- 16 Ms. Hendricks.
- 17 Is Brandon Smith available? Star six
- 18 to unmute if you're on the phone or click the
- 19 microphone icon on your computer screen.
- Okay. Mr. Smith, we were not hearing
- 21 you. We'll try to come back to you also.
- I see someone that is listed as an
- 23 unknown user, but it has the microphone unmuted.
- 24 Please state your name clearly. You will have
- 25 three minutes to speak.

- 1 MS. LIVINGSTON: Yes. My name is Kayla
- 2 Livingston, K-A-Y-L-A L-I-V-I-N-G-S-T-O-N. And I
- 3 am very much opposed to this permit.
- 4 I live across the street from the
- 5 plant, just up the road going toward Fujifilm. My
- 6 husband and I have owned this house for 12 years,
- 7 but over the last couple of years we've had a lot
- 8 of issues. We've had, of course, the particulate
- 9 matter that everyone has spoken about has been a
- 10 major issue. We've had issues with it being on
- 11 our roof, on our vehicles, all over our son's
- 12 toys. There were periods of times where we
- weren't able to spend any time outdoors because of
- 14 it. We both have to take Zyrtec every day and
- 15 have for the last two years, and that was not
- 16 something we had to do the ten years before that.
- 17 There have been extreme issues with
- 18 noise. Particularity at night, the plant seems to
- 19 be making a humming noise that keeps us and
- 20 especially our 8-year-old son up at night.
- 21 There's beating and banging on the railroad cars,
- 22 which I've heard other people mention. There is
- 23 also issues with -- just the noise is unbearable
- 24 for the most part.
- It's just really been difficult for us.

- 1 In general, there are times when there are log
- 2 trucks lined up and down the road waiting to get
- 3 into the plant. They live -- they leave large
- 4 chunks of wood in the road right in front of our
- 5 house on 246 that we end up -- it ends up in our
- 6 yard because people run over it, and then we cut
- 7 it up with the lawn mower. That's posed a lot of
- 8 issues for lawn mower blades.
- 9 I've heard no single person that lives
- 10 in the vicinity of this plant support this
- 11 ridiculous permit. I understand that you want to
- 12 improve things, but you have tied improving things
- in with a permit to produce more. It's all about
- 14 money, and you care nothing about the people that
- 15 live around this plant. There is no sense in
- 16 allowing this permit to go through to produce more
- 17 when you cannot even control the emissions that
- 18 are currently being produced. That makes no
- 19 sense. If you want to put in new sensors, new
- 20 ways to decrease the particulate matters, then do
- 21 that. But do not increase production. That makes
- 22 no sense, and it's not fair to those of us who
- live around here whose land no longer has value,
- 24 whose homes no longer have value. I can't sell my
- 25 house. I can't sell my land. No one wants to

- 1 live across the street from that plant.
- 2 This has become a major issue for
- 3 everyone in this area. We appreciate Chris Brown
- 4 trying to come out and talk with us, give cards,
- 5 things like that. But that's not gonna cut it.
- 6 It's not fair to increase production, for us to
- 7 continue to suffer health loss, sleep loss, sanity
- 8 loss because we live across the street from this
- 9 terrible plant. Please do not increase
- 10 production. Please make more efforts to do your
- 11 part in reducing the emissions that are produced
- 12 by this plant and make this a liveable area for
- 13 generations to come, like my son, who's going to
- 14 be raised in this area. Thank you.
- 15 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Thank you,
- 16 Ms. Livingston.
- 17 I want to go back to Florence Anoruo
- 18 that was called on previously. Florence Anoruo,
- if you are available, please unmute your line
- 20 using start six if you're on the phone or press
- 21 the microphone if you're on your computer.
- Okay. We will go back to Lynn
- 23 Hendricks.
- 24 Brandon Smith?
- I see one other unknown user that has

- 1 their microphone unmuted. Please state your name
- 2 clearly, and you will have three minutes for your
- 3 comment.
- 4 Okay. I'll give you one more
- 5 opportunity. We have someone else that has
- 6 unmuted. It is phone number with the last four
- 7 digits of 6909. Please state your name clearly,
- 8 spell your name, and you will have three minutes
- 9 for your comment.
- DR. ANORUO: This is Dr. Florence
- 11 Anoruo. First name is F-L-O-R-E-N-C-E; last name
- 12 is A-N-O-R-U-O. I'm a plant physiologist, an
- 13 environmental scientist, and environmental justice
- 14 advocate.
- 15 And my comment is that during this
- 16 pandemic it has been known throughout the nation
- 17 that black and brown communities have been
- 18 adversely affected by COVID-19. And the big
- 19 reason for that is because of all the factors that
- they have been unjustly impacted by, ranging from
- 21 pollution to food insecurity to access to health
- 22 care. And this time, it's the wrong time to put
- 23 any other additional adverse impact on these
- 24 communities. With the expansion of Enviva at this
- 25 time, that would adversely impact the health of

- 1 those communities and environments. And I am
- 2 joining a large group of other scientists and
- 3 organizations to ask that the permit be halted
- 4 during this time while we're -- people are still
- 5 suffering from the pandemic and trying to figure
- 6 out how they're going to survive and live with all
- 7 the other environmental health issues they are
- 8 facing.
- 9 So we are asking and joining others in
- 10 a collective voice to ask that the permit be
- 11 halted for now and also that the Enviva also look
- 12 at the impact of their actions and the (inaudible)
- in these communities, what it's -- how it's
- 14 affecting the lives of the people.
- 15 And I hope that also the time that
- 16 people will have opportunity to air their views
- 17 about what is going on in their communities should
- 18 be taken into consideration. The cumulative
- 19 effects of these impacts along with what's already
- 20 happening now should all be taken into
- 21 consideration when these permits are given, and
- 22 this is the wrong time. There are a lot of cases
- 23 of cancer and other health-related effects in
- these communities, and these people cannot afford
- to be exposed to any more pollution of any kind.

- 1 So we're asking for an injunction on the
- 2 permitting of any expansion or establishment of
- 3 any wood pellet facility in this neighborhood at
- 4 this time. Thank you.
- 5 TECHNOLOGY HOST BOYCE: Thank you. I'm
- 6 glad you were able to call in.
- 7 At this time, I see no other unmuted
- 8 lines. I would like to give an opportunity for
- 9 anyone else who has not already spoken to unmute
- 10 your line by using star six on your phone or the
- 11 microphone icon on your computer, and we will call
- 12 on you in order.
- Monica, I see no other attendees
- 14 indicating they would like to make an oral comment
- 15 at this time. Would you like to proceed?
- 16 HEARING OFFICER TAYLOR: Yes. Thank
- 17 you, Lawra.
- Thank you, Kristy.
- 19 There are no other attendees who would
- 20 like to make a comment. The comment portion of
- 21 tonight's public hearing is now concluded.
- 22 Please note once again any comments
- 23 made via the chat box during tonight's public
- 24 hearing will not serve as an official comment on
- 25 record, and the agency will not respond to any

- 1 written comments posted in the chat box. However,
- 2 anything typed into the chat box is subject to be
- 3 included in the record of the public hearing.
- 4 All written comments for official
- 5 records may be submitted to DHEC by mail or by
- 6 e-mail through August 27th, 2020. Comments should
- 7 be addressed to the attention of the Bureau of Air
- 8 Quality public notice coordinator. Once the
- 9 public comment period closes, DHEC will review and
- 10 consider all comments received prior to making a
- 11 final decision. Additional information may also
- 12 be requested from the applicant. Once a final
- decision is made, a summary response to written
- 14 comments will be posted on our web page and
- 15 provided to everyone on our mailing list.
- 16 You have the right to request a final
- 17 review of any permit decision made by DHEC. The
- 18 final review request must be submitted in writing
- 19 to DHEC's clerk of the board along with a filing
- 20 fee in the amount of \$100 within 15 calendar days
- 21 after notice of DHEC's permit decision has been
- 22 made.
- In consideration of these requirements,
- 24 you will receive notification of DHEC's permit
- decision by standard U.S. mail or by e-mail. If

- 1 you wish to be notified of DHEC's decision by
- 2 certified mail instead, please make your request
- 3 in writing no later than August 27th, 2020.
- 4 Finally, there is a link on our web
- 5 page to the public hearing survey Lawra mentioned
- 6 earlier. We are interested in knowing your
- 7 thoughts and suggestions about tonight's virtual
- 8 public hearing and how DHEC can improve the way we
- 9 communicate and share information with you.
- 10 Please take a moment to complete this survey
- 11 within the next couple of days.
- 12 On behalf of DHEC, I would again like
- 13 to thank you for your attendance and your comments
- 14 this evening. The time is now 9:28 p.m., and this
- 15 hearing is officially adjourned. Thank you and
- 16 good night.
- 17 (The public hearing was concluded at
- 18 9:28 p.m.)
- 19 (This transcript may contain quoted
- 20 material. Such material is reproduced as read or
- 21 quoted by the speaker.)
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

1	STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA.)
2	COUNTY OF HORRY)
	COUNTY OF HORRY
3	
4	
5	Be it known that Alison Peterson took the foregoing proceeding and hereby attests:
6	one reregering proceeding and neres, accesss
7	That I was then and there a notary
8	public in and for the State of South Carolina at-large and that by virtue thereof I was duly
9	authorized to administer an oath;
10	
11	That the foregoing transcript represents a true, accurate, and complete
12	transcription of the testimony so given at the time and place aforesaid to the best of my skill
13	and ability;
	That I am neither a relative nor an employee of any of the parties hereto, nor of any
15	attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor interested in the outcome of this
16	action;
17	In witness thereof, I have hereunto
18	affixed my signature and title.
19	
20	
21	allan M. Peteran
22	Culden 1 1. Gettiden
23	Alison N. Peterson,
24	Court Reporter My Commission expires
25	April 11, 2023